



External Evaluation  
Humanitarian support to vulnerable households  
in the most water and sanitation scarce and cold  
regions of Afghanistan

Funded by ECHO

Sarah House, August 2011

## Acknowledgements

Sincere thanks to the men and women of the communities in Du Layna District and the ACF staff from both Du Layna and Shahrak Districts of Ghor Province for travelling to Chaghcharan and Du Layna at short notice and in an unstable security situation, to be able to contribute their experiences and views on the ACF supported WASH projects as part of the evaluation.

Thanks also to the representatives of the Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (Ghor), Voices of Women Organisation (Ghor), UNICEF (Kabul), OXFAM-GB (Kabul) and Women for Women (Kabul) for their contributions through meetings or email.

And final thanks to all of the ACF WASH and other team members in Ghor Province, Kabul, Paris, London and elsewhere, for their support throughout the evaluation including sharing project details, discussing ideas, providing logistics and translation and their general hospitality.

All of the above efforts and contributions were particularly valued because the evaluation occurred during Ramadan and in the week just before Eid, but everyone still made their best effort to ensure that the evaluation could be as effective as possible.

It should be noted that the views expressed in this evaluation are those of the evaluator alone.

### Photographs:

All photographs included in this report have been provided by the ACF WASH team in Ghor Province.

## Acronyms & Terminology

### Acronyms

<b>ACBAR</b>	Agency Co-ordinating Body for Afghan Relief
<b>ACF</b>	Action Contre La Fam
<b>ANDMA</b>	Afghan National Disaster Management Authority
<b>ANDS</b>	Afghan National Reconstruction Strategy (2008-2013)
<b>AOG</b>	Armed Opposition Group
<b>ARTF</b>	Afghan Reconstruction Trust Fund (pooled funding mechanism)
<b>CDC</b>	Community Development Committee (used under the NSP)
<b>CHP</b>	Community Hygiene Promoter
<b>CRS</b>	Catholic Relief Services
<b>GPS</b>	Global Positioning System
<b>MoWA</b>	Ministry of Women's Affairs
<b>MHM</b>	Menstruation Hygiene Management
<b>MoE</b>	Ministry of Education
<b>MoPH</b>	Ministry of Public Health
<b>MRRD</b>	Ministry of Rural Relief and Development
<b>NCSA</b>	National Civil Society Assembly
<b>NSP</b>	National Solidarity Programme
<b>UNAMA</b>	UN Assistance Mission to Afghanistan
<b>UNICEF</b>	United Nations Children's Fund
<b>VWO</b>	Voice of Women's Organisation
<b>WASH</b>	Water, Sanitation & Hygiene
<b>WC</b>	Water Committee
<b>WFWI</b>	Women for Women International

### Terminology

<b>Karazes</b>	Traditional water channels from springs with intermittent vertical wells
<b>Shura</b>	Governing body of a village / leaders
<b>Welayats</b>	Provinces
<b>Mahram</b>	Male relative acting as guardian for an Afgani woman

# Contents

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>ACRONYMS &amp; TERMINOLOGY</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>CONTENTS</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>2. BACKGROUND INFORMATION</b> .....	<b>7</b>
2.1    CONTEXT.....	7
2.2    OBJECTIVES AND RESULTS OF THE PROJECT .....	7
<b>3. TERMS OF REFERENCE AND METHODOLOGY</b> .....	<b>8</b>
3.1    TERMS OF REFERENCE, METHODOLOGY AND SCHEDULE FOR THE EVALUATION .....	8
3.2    LIMITATIONS.....	8
<b>4. FINDINGS &amp; DISCUSSIONS</b> .....	<b>9</b>
4.1    STRUCTURE OF FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION SECTION .....	9
4.2    GENDER, SECURITY, REMOTE MONITORING AND VULNERABLE GROUPS .....	10
4.2.1 <i>Gender and programme design</i> .....	10
4.2.2 <i>Security in Ghor Province</i> .....	16
4.2.3 <i>Remote monitoring</i> .....	16
4.2.4 <i>Targeting of vulnerable groups</i> .....	19
4.3    IMPACT.....	22
4.4    ACTIVITIES AND COVERAGE .....	22
4.4.1 <i>Population and villages</i> .....	22
4.4.2 <i>Selection of project villages</i> .....	23
4.4.3 <i>KAP survey before and after the project</i> .....	24
4.4.4 <i>Planned activities and those reported to be completed</i> .....	25
4.5    RELEVANCE / APPROPRIATENESS AND EFFECTIVENESS.....	26
4.5.1 <i>Water supply</i> .....	26
4.5.2 <i>Excreta disposal</i> .....	28
4.5.3 <i>Hygiene promotion</i> .....	29
4.5.4 <i>School hygiene and sanitation</i> .....	31
4.5.5 <i>Winter kit</i> .....	32
4.6    COHERENCE.....	32
4.8    EFFICIENCY .....	33
4.9    SUSTAINABILITY .....	33
4.10    OTHER CROSS-CUTTING ISSUES .....	34
4.10.1 <i>Environment</i> .....	34
<b>5. CONCLUSIONS &amp; RECOMMENDATIONS</b> .....	<b>35</b>
5.1    SWOT AND SCORING OF PROJECT VERSUS DAC CRITERIA .....	35
5.2    CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS – IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROGRAMME .....	37
5.1.1 <i>Gender, vulnerability</i> .....	37
5.1.2 <i>Water supply</i> .....	37
5.1.3 <i>Excreta disposal</i> .....	38
5.1.4 <i>Hygiene promotion</i> .....	38
5.1.4 <i>School water, sanitation and hygiene promotion</i> .....	39
5.1.6 <i>Winter kit</i> .....	39
5.3    CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS – MANAGEMENT.....	40
5.4    CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS – ACF INTERNATIONALLY .....	41
5.5    CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS – ECHO AND OTHER DONORS .....	41

<b>ANNEXES .....</b>	<b>42</b>
<b>ANNEX I. TERMS OF REFERENCE, METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>43</b>
<i>Annex I.1 Terms of Reference .....</i>	<i>43</i>
<i>Annex I.2 Methodology.....</i>	<i>45</i>
<i>Annex I.3 Schedule.....</i>	<i>46</i>
<b>ANNEX II. PERSONS MET .....</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>ANNEX III. BACKGROUND INFORMATION .....</b>	<b>52</b>
<i>Annex III.1 ACF Strategy, WASH Policy &amp; Gender Policy.....</i>	<i>52</i>
<i>Annex III.3 Target area - Geography, demography, culture, politics, security.....</i>	<i>53</i>
<i>Annex III.4 Gender and vulnerable groups.....</i>	<i>53</i>
<i>Annex III.5 Target area – WASH context.....</i>	<i>55</i>
<i>Annex III.5 History of ACF in Afghanistan and the Ghor Province programme.....</i>	<i>57</i>
<b>ANNEX IV. PHOTOGRAPHIC EVIDENCE OF THE PROJECT ACTIVITIES.....</b>	<b>58</b>
<b>ANNEX V. ACTIVITIES TO BE COMPLETED VS PLANNED ACTIVITIES .....</b>	<b>62</b>
<b>ANNEX VI. KITS PROVIDED THROUGH THE PROJECT.....</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>ANNEX VII. INFORMATION PROVIDED TO STAFF TEAM.....</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>ANNEX VIII. REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>74</b>

## 1. Executive Summary

**The evaluation** – The ECHO funded project (to be referred to in this report as ‘the Project’) A122, ‘Humanitarian Support to Vulnerable Households in the Most Water and Sanitation Scarce and Cold Regions of Afghanistan’ (AS/BUD/2010/01008) was implemented by ACF in Ghor Province of Afghanistan, from July 2010 to June 2011. This report documents the external end of project evaluation of the project which was undertaken during August 2011. The evaluator was not able to travel to the villages due to security restrictions but was able to meet male beneficiaries in the provincial centre and to speak to three women beneficiaries by SKYPE.

**Background** – ACF has been working in Afghanistan since 1995 and in Ghor Province since 2007. It started implementing projects in the two districts of Du Layna and Shahrak in 2009 with the initial ECHO funded project, ECHO/AS/BUD/2009/01019, from July 2009 - June 2010. Ghor Province is a drought prone remote province, with high levels of illiteracy and stark gender disparities.

**Activities / coverage** – The project supported water supply construction and rehabilitation, the training of water committees and handpump mechanics, the training on sanitation construction, hygiene promotion using a number of channels, the distribution of a winter kit to the extreme poor and the distribution of biosand filters in smaller villages. The overall programme has benefitted over 23,220 beneficiaries. The evaluator is not able to comment on the beneficiaries for the school latrine programme as evidence was not available of its completion during the evaluation period. ACF Kabul will be following up on this issue.

**Gender and vulnerable groups** – The ACF team in Ghor have made a good effort to try and ensure that women as well as men are involved in the project, and whilst the participation of women is not on an equal basis as the men, considering the context of extreme gender disparities some good progress has been made. The extreme poor were targeted for receipt of a winter kit. The demonstration latrines were not targeted to the most vulnerable.

**Work schedule, staffing, remote monitoring and documentation** – The programme is working in an area which is increasingly insecure and faces disruption from a severe winter, meaning that the programme team effectively only have approximately 125 of working day per year for implementation (which is just above half of a full working year) for working in 126 villages. A range of excel spreadsheets have been produced for the programme and a high level of effort to document the programmes work. But some challenges have been faced due to the translation and different ways names of villages are noted. A process of mapping is proposed using Google Earth. There is also only one WASH staff member who speaks English leading to significant pressure on the Programme Manager for documentation as well as management tasks. Efforts have been made to recruit an additional senior staff member to support him in his responsibilities but it has been unsuccessful. It is proposed to recruit a young school leaver to train up into a management position. There is also a need to intensify efforts to recruit the WASH Co-ordinator in Kabul, for Kabul to be able to increase its visits for monitoring and technical support.

**Impact** – The beneficiaries met indicated that they had benefitted greatly from the project, mainly in relation to an observed reduction in sickness and disease, also in relation to the time taken to collect water and also for the poorest from the distribution of the winter kit, particularly from the blankets. The end of project KAP was not available at the time of the evaluation. The beneficiaries and the provincial authorities expressed their appreciation of ACF working in the districts in a province.

**Coherence** – The programme had made a good effort to be coherent with national WASH related policy and guidelines and ACF is part of a sector learning group on CLTS. The school WASH programme was not however clear and hence it is not possible to comment on its coherence.

**Relevance, appropriateness, effectiveness** – The water elements of the programme were appropriate and indications are that the water committees know how to repair their facilities. The programme is already planning to modify its approaches for sanitation from a subsidy approach to one of Community-Led Total Sanitation, a move which the evaluator supports. However, some attention is required to look at the approaches of the school WASH programme, which the evaluator was unable to investigate due to no photographic evidence and inconsistent data and to revisit the gravity supply projects from springs which have faced some technical problems and need surveying and design checks. The winter kit distribution process involving a detailed targeting of the extreme poor seems to have really reached the poorest but also posed some challenges for the team. The

targeting process has been identified as an example of good practice and recommendations have been made for improving the targeting process for the future.

**Efficiency** – With the project budget of Euro 690,000 and beneficiary numbers of 23,200, the ultimate cost considering all elements is Euro 29 / beneficiary, or considering materials, equipment and logistics costs is Euro 18 / beneficiary. This is reasonable considering the remoteness of the villages, security challenges and limitations on time for implementation.

### **Recommendations - Programme:**

Gender, vulnerability - Revisit / strengthen gender aspects of the programme. Incorporate menstrual hygiene management, consider supporting women's groups in soap making & menstrual pad production as a trial programme; ensure consideration of vulnerable groups.

Water supply - Undertake a technical assessment of all of the gravity supply systems and school latrine constructions and to look at quality of the water points. Revisit the biosand villages and undertake a practical exercise to revisit the process for cleaning the filter and consider if it is possible to support a private sector supplier to sell the biosand filter.

Excreta disposal - Revisit all communities checking that the ownership and responsibility for all workshop and demonstration latrines is clear. Continue to engage with the co-ordination mechanism for those implementing CLTS in Afghanistan and the number of follow up activities in communities over several years. Consider training community masons to know how to construct a number of latrine options and ensure the latrine designs offer a range of costs. Consider menstrual hygiene needs and that the designs offer privacy for women and are accessible. Send the samples of the 'square' domed slabs to the University or Kabul or similar institution for load bearing tests.

Hygiene promotion - Reflect on the current hygiene materials and methods used for hygiene promotion and undertake more in-depth learning of motivators for good hygiene behaviour. Consider new activities which could be used to help the community members be more likely to improve and practice good hygiene behaviours. Integrate menstrual hygiene management into the hygiene promotion activities and consider ways to improve the collation of hygiene promotion activity data for more accuracy..

School water, sanitation and hygiene promotion - Revisit the school sanitation and hygiene promotion activities to strengthen the interventions supporting the children in their hygiene learning over time.

Winter kit - Revise the methodology for identification of the winter kit as detailed in the report.

### **Recommendations – management:**

Undertake continued capacity building for the WASH PM and recruit a newly qualified school leaver to be trained up as the deputy to the WASH Programme Manager. Pay the masons for their retention over the winter months and reflect on the remote monitoring processes, document monitoring systems and revise as appropriate. Technical assessments are required for all of the spring and gravity projects and all of the school latrine construction projects, to survey, design and check implementation and quality of construction. A mapping process should be undertaken for all projects. Contacts should be established with experienced Afghan women for consultancies and consider linking up with the health sector for monitoring as well as establishing a monitoring and gender post and intensifying efforts to fill the WASH Co-ordinator post. Undertake an assessment of offices and accommodation from a gender perspective.

### **Recommendations – ACF internationally**

Ensure the involvement of women as well as men to be non-negotiable in all evaluations. ACF should consider menstrual hygiene management and how it can integrate it into its programmes and identify funding for and providing on-going monitoring support to communities.

### **Recommendations – ECHO and other donors**

Humanitarian donors to commit to funding a percentage of new projects for organisations to provide on-going support to previous projects (from any donor).

## 2. Background Information

### 2.1 Context

ACF has been working in Afghanistan since 1995 and in Ghor Province since 2007. It started implementing projects in the two districts of Du Layna and Shahrak in 2009 with the initial ECHO funded project, ECHO/AS/BUD/2009/01019, from July 2009 - June 2010.

Ghor Province has the second worst coverage of water supply of all Provinces in Afghanistan, with an estimated 8% access to improved water supply and an estimated access to latrines at 5% of the total population. Literacy in Afghanistan is estimated at 24% of the total population, with literacy of women and men at 13% and 32% respectively. In Ghor the total literacy is estimated at 15% with the literacy of women and men at 3% and 25% respectively. 75% of the land area is mountainous with scattered remote communities which are often cut off in winter and are drought-prone in the summer. ACF is only one of five NGOs implementing WASH projects in Ghor Province and the only NGO working on WASH in the two districts of Du Layna and Shahrak.

Whilst women are equal within the Constitution, gender disparities are stark in Afghanistan, with women being restricted in their movement and activity, which poses multiple challenges for effective engagement of women as well as men in the project processes and ensuring that the needs and priorities of both men and women are responded to. The level of mobility of women, and their ability to move outside the home and interact with others varies across Afghanistan and family to family and any involvement of women in projects or changes to gender norms requires discussion and consultation at household and community levels.

More details on the following can be found in **Annex III**:

- ACF strategy, WASH Policy, Gender Policy
- Target area - Geography, demography, culture, politics, security
- Target area - Gender and vulnerable groups
- Target area - WASH context
  - WASH situation in Ghor Province
  - WASH sector in Afghanistan and Ghor Province
  - Afghanistan National WASH Policy, 2010
- History of ACFs work in Ghor Province

### 2.2 Objectives and results of the project

#### **Objectives and results of the Project**

**Principal Objective:** To provide relief and assistance in terms of water and sanitation and non food items to vulnerable households in Ghor province, Afghanistan.

**Specific Objective:** To improve the basic living conditions of vulnerable communities in the province of Ghor.

#### **Results:**

Result 1: 3220 families in the districts of Du Layna and Shahrak have sustainable access to safe drinking water and water for other domestic use.

Result 2: 544 families and 10 schools in the districts of Du Layna and Shahrak have community-based safer disposal of excreta, reducing the spread of potential diseases, through latrine construction.

Result 3: 3220 families in the districts of Du Layna and Shahrak benefiting from the 106 public water points (60 new, 40 repair water points and from the 6 protected karezes) will have access to hygiene knowledge and are enabled to improve hygiene behaviours.

Result 4: 500 remote families in the districts of Du Layna and Shahrak will be supported with non food items and good hygiene practices messages to protect them from the extreme condition on winter. time.

## 3. Terms of Reference and Methodology

### 3.1 Terms of reference, methodology and schedule for the evaluation

The terms of reference including the scope of the evaluation, methodology and schedule for the evaluation can be found in Annex I.

A total of 24.5 days were spent on the evaluation<sup>16</sup> with a total of 7 days in Ghor province and no days visiting the villages due to security limitations. See discussions on this in the **Section 3.2** below on limitations.

### 3.2 Limitations

This evaluation had multiple limitations which are documented in the following table.

**Table 1 - Limitations for the evaluation**

	Limitation	Impact on the evaluation
1	Insecurity in the area meant that the evaluator was unable to travel outside of the provincial centre	The evaluator was unable to see the implemented projects or to meet the beneficiaries in their own villages
2	ACF security restrictions leading to the WASH team in Ghor Province only being told the day before the evaluator was arriving that she was arriving	Hence no arrangements could be made with the beneficiaries or other actors in advance and previously planned activities by the team had to be displaced or delayed
3	Various security alerts in Kabul during the period of the evaluation placed limitations on visiting government offices in Kabul	No government offices were visited in Kabul
4	The evaluation fell during Ramadan and also in the week leading up to Eid and hence the offices were generally closed by 2pm and also were planning to take leave for the Eid period	It was difficult to make arrangements with external stakeholders and also the ACF Ghor WASH team were not available for the whole period that the evaluator was in Ghor Province; There was also no possibility to have a learning workshop at the end of the evaluation because most staff were on leave at this time
5	The report on the final KAP survey and the final project report were not completed by the time of the evaluation	This limited the evidence available for the evaluation on the impact of the project
6	No photographic evidence was available of the school latrines and only very limited photographic evidence of the sanitation components of the programme were available	It was difficult for the evaluator to confirm the existence of or the quality of the school latrine interventions and the quality of the sanitation interventions
7	No consideration had been made before the evaluation of mechanisms for the evaluator to meet with female as well as male beneficiaries	Had the evaluator not been persistent to ensure that she had access to speak with at least some women beneficiaries then she would only have had access to men
8	Funding limitations – leading to a reduction of the number of days for the evaluation from 23 to 19	Less time to spend with beneficiaries, programme staff or desk work and write up

In reality out of the 19 days of the evaluation this meant that the evaluator had a total of:

- 2 days with beneficiaries (16 men in 3 groups who came to the provincial centre to meet with the evaluator, and 3 women who the evaluator spoke with via SKYPE with support from a male translator and office staff)

<sup>16</sup> Versus the contracted 19 days

- 2 days with staff from the Ghor WASH programme (plus some email / phone contact following the visit)
- 0.5 days of meetings with external stakeholders in Ghor
- 0.5 days of meetings / discussions with external stakeholders in Kabul
- The WASH Advisor from Kabul, was present for the full two weeks and available for questions and discussion

The other days were used questioning ACF staff more generally, analysing documents, looking at photographs and report writing. Some additional questions were also discussed and answered by email by the Ghor WASH team.

The table below compares this evaluation to the last evaluation undertaken in a neighbouring region (Dai Kundi) in 2007.

**Table 2 - Comparison of days allocated to Ghor evaluation 2001 to Dai Kundi evaluation, 2007**

	Dai Kundi, 2007	Ghor, 2011
Total days for the evaluation	34	19
Days spent visiting villages and projects	8	0
Days spent in the Province	19	7 (including 2 with beneficiaries; 2 with Ghor Province WASH staff)

Whilst the evaluator has made her best effort to gather information from various sources, triangulate data and make analysis, and the teams in country were open and shared the information freely within the limited time available, the conclusions made should be considered in the context of the multiple limitations noted above.

In the context of Afghanistan where there are a high level of gender disparities leading to limited access for women to persons external to her family and village, it is challenging for anyone to meet with women, but in particular male staff or evaluators. Hence it was disappointing to see that ACF had not made prior efforts / arrangements to ensure that the female evaluator would have some mechanism to speak with women beneficiaries as part of the evaluation. Whilst all staff responded to do their best to make arrangements once the evaluator requested them to at each level, it would have been positive to see that ACF as an international NGO would themselves ensure that women were not excluded from the evaluation process. There are lessons here for ACF internationally in terms of the requirements for their evaluations which are discussed later in the report.

## 4. Findings & Discussions

### 4.1 Structure of findings and discussion section

Gender and security are key considerations in Afghanistan and in Ghor Province impacting on the design, implementation and final impacts of WASH programmes. Because of this and because of some interesting work that the programme has undertaken relating to targeting of the vulnerable, the section on findings and discussions starts off with a dedicated section on gender, security, remote monitoring and vulnerable groups, rather than a brief mention at the end of the report as per common evaluation report writing practice. The section then continues on to consider the standard DAC evaluation criteria of impact, coverage, coherence, appropriateness / relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and an additional cross-cutting issue.

## 4.2 Gender, security, remote monitoring and vulnerable groups

### 4.2.1 Gender and programme design

As discussed above in **Annex 111.4** on gender in Afghanistan, gender roles, responsibilities and practices disparities are significant in Afghanistan. They are some of the starkest in the world (coming 134 out of 137 countries ranked versus a gender equality ratio), but it should be noted that there are variations between people of different ethnic groups, between and within provinces. Following are a few observations on the issues which directly impact on the implementation of the project and how ACF has responded or otherwise.

#### Gender and the National WASH Policy in Afghanistan, 2010

The National WASH Policy in Afghanistan clearly identifies women as the primary stakeholders in WASH in Afghanistan and clearly recommends putting women at the centre of WASH projects and decision making. It recommends involving men and women in this process. The Policy also recommends that menstrual hygiene management should be integrated into hygiene promotion programmes and into school WASH and that latrines for schools should be separate for girls and boys and consider the needs of adolescent girls in their design. Refer to **Annex III.4** for other relevant aspects.

#### Ability of women to participate alongside men in the village context

Through various discussions with ACF staff, both male and female, and with the men and women beneficiaries of the ACF projects in Ghor Province it was clear that whether women are able to participate in projects as well as men and how they can participate, depends on the programme understanding and responding to the gender norms of the particular area. It was noted that in Kabul it is more difficult to bring women together for hygiene promotion, whereas in Ghor Province it was common practice that women would be all brought together in one meeting or in groups depending of the preference of the particular village.

The three women who spoke to the evaluator through SKYPE confirmed that they were brought together into one group in one room (presumably of a house) to have hygiene promotion sessions in their villages. It was also confirmed by the women themselves that they had roles on the Water Committee (two as Community Hygiene Promoters and one as a Caretaker of the well) and that within the context of the Water Committee their views were listened to and the men treated them respectfully.

#### Movement of women to attend meetings or trainings

It was noted by one contributor that women could also meet with women from neighbouring villages as the people would tend to be related or considered as relatives, but not travel further; although it was also noted by another contributors that women also do sometimes travel with their mahrams to the district and even provincial centres for other purposes, such as attending a hospital.

However, for women to be brought to a district centre for training, was considered by the ACF WASH team in Ghor to not be possible, and hence only the male Caretakers of the water points were brought to the district centre for the three day of training on maintaining the handpump, and the women were not invited. It was noted that the women and men had received some guidance in their villages as part of the project. This aspect was not discussed directly with the women themselves to investigate if there was a compromise solution for the women to also attend an all-women training session? Investigating this would be positive for future programmes.

#### Availability of female staff and mobility

One of the challenges for ensuring women are able to engage in all stages of the project is that women need women staff to be available to discuss with them instead of men. ACF has managed to overcome this issue to a greater degree for some elements of its programmes by employing Hygiene Promotion Couple who are a man and woman who are related, either as man and wife, or as brother and sister, so that the woman can travel, ensuring both her safety and her families honour. The couples support the hygiene promotion activities in the villages by the woman of the couple meeting with women in their individual houses (as in Kabul) or in groups (as in Ghor) and the man meeting with men in the mosque or an open location and in the schools (for both girl and boy students).

It was also noted that women also engage in other stages of the project through the involvement of the female member of the hygiene promotion couple. This includes during the assessment process (a

HP couple was noted as part of the team for the assessment for the project) and for the initial meeting with the community, although it was not possible to check how consistent this practice was during the period of the evaluation with the limited number of beneficiaries met.

ACF in Afghanistan had also previously faced a challenge when it brought the hygiene couples from Ghor Province to Kabul with the other staff to attend training sessions during the winter period. There was an incidence of violence between a couple and the man of the couple had to be sacked from his position, which also meant that the woman also lost her post. Two of the women from the couples did not return to Ghor Province with their husbands, causing a range of problems and accusations for the ACF team. This incident clearly highlights how difficult it is to ensure the human rights of women are respected as well as those of men, but also finding ways to be respectful of the local culture and customs and to be able to implement effective projects.

An additional concern that was raised for the women staff from the local area, related to the increasing insecurity. The only female local staff member who was met in Ghor expressed her concern about whether she and her husband would be able to continue with their jobs because of the increasing insecurity. ACF has also faced a number of resignations from staff (WASH, other sectors and logistics / admin staff) over the past year such as related to individual or their families concerns over travel in certain areas or down certain roads or threats to their families.

#### Challenges for using photographic evidence of women's involvement in the project as part of the remote monitoring systems

It was noted when viewing the photographic evidence from the project that there were very few pictures of women being involved in the projects, which on first consideration would make an external person, believe that in reality women have not been involved to the degree that has been stated by the project team. However it was noted that women in Afghanistan do not like or are not allowed to have their photos taken and hence this is why they are not in the vast majority of the photographs. It should be noted that even the one female staff member met in Ghor Province asked permission of her husband before giving permission for the evaluator to take a picture of the group of hygiene staff being interviewed to include herself. This does however, in the context of remote management, monitoring and evaluation, pose additional challenges for validation that women are being involved in all stages of the projects, and that they are happy with the processes and their opinions on the impacts, and is another reason why ACF should find alternative solutions for ensuring that women's involvement and opinions are verified. It should be noted that women were photographed as part of the winter kit distribution and training sessions, so this contradicts the statement that women cannot be photographed, although it also poses the question as to whether they were only photographed because they were the poorest and more vulnerable and hence had less say? More consideration needs to be made of this issue within the programme in relation to documenting the projects activities.

#### Women, girls, menstrual hygiene management and WASH

Menstrual Hygiene Management has for many years been a taboo subject in most cultures around the world. It is however an important fact of life for all girls and women from the age of menarche / adolescence to menopause, affecting them between 5-10 days every month of their lives during this period. Increasingly the WASH sector is realising that responding to the hygiene and sanitation issues around menstruation and understanding that its management is an integral part of sanitation and hygiene. Particular issues around MHM for girls and women include: the nature of the subject being taboo, leading to girl's not receiving information from their mothers or elder women relatives on menses leading to ignorance of girls as they reach the age for the start of their menstruation; girls missing school on their days of menses because of the poor water, sanitation and hygiene conditions in their schools; the continuation of bad practices related to MHM because of inappropriate myths; and issues around girls and women being able to afford and clean and dry or dispose of adequate menstrual hygiene materials.

UNICEF in Afghanistan has already undertaken research on this issue with girls in schools, their mothers and teachers and has developed some draft training materials for teachers and an information booklet for girls<sup>17</sup>. The research they undertook involved 60 girls from schools in Kabul and Parwan Province, 25 teachers and 50 mothers selected by the Ministry of Education<sup>18</sup>.

Key issues which are highlighted for girls and women in Afghanistan through this research include:

- 82% of the girls were unaware of the menses process until onset
- 42% of girls thought menses was natural, 7% as a disease
- Many girls and women do not wash their bodies during the period of menstruation due to a myth commonly held in Afghanistan<sup>19</sup>; 70% of the girls noted that do not eat certain foods such as sour foods or vegetables and do not take a shower up to the end of menses - this practice will both be unpleasant for girls and women during this period when in fact they should be washing more during the menstrual period, and also a risk to health as infections may also occur due to the imposed limitations of hygiene;
- 82% of the girls reused cloth pieces for their sanitary protection both in middle and high school
- 29% of girls did not attend school during their menstrual period because of heavy bleeding and no changing facilities at schools

The challenge of engaging in this issue however will also be the limited number of female staff working on the programmes for ACF in Afghanistan and working in the rural areas

As part of the evaluation the evaluator would have liked to investigate with some of the women beneficiaries if they would have been interested in ACF incorporating these issues into their hygiene promotion work, but this was impossible to do with a male translator and a male staff member assisting through the SKYPE which was the only channel possible to speak with women during this evaluation. A separate part of hygiene materials only for the women hygiene promoters to use, could be developed and utilised as part of the programme both with women and girls.

It is recommended that ACF takes up the opportunity of the work and learning that UNICEF has started to learn what could be possible in the context of Afghanistan and to integrate elements into its programmes and also with OXFAM-GB who have integrated MHM into their hygiene promotion programmes and school WASH activities

## *Girls wishes in relation to menstruation<sup>1</sup>*

*The wishes of the girls as expressed in the research on their experiences of menstruation in Afghanistan are enlightening:*

- *Girls want to be aware about menstruation and the physiological changes*
- *We don't want to keep away from society due to unawareness of menstruation*
- *We want to have knowledgeable parents, specially our mothers to be aware of menstrual health and hygiene to help us prior to the start of the period*
- *We are eager to build up our education and have good reputation in the society, so we don't like to be absent from school, each month because of unavailability of the school facility*
- *We want to have a special subject about menstruation health and hygiene at school even before starting our period*
- *Teachers are our second parents we expect them to teach us in this regard*
- *We need the facilities to safely dispose and manage the napkin at school*
- *Access to proper hand washing facilities and soap at schools*
- *We wish to have access to shops with low price, good quality pads with female seller at school*
- *They want to have a health centre at school (a room for rehabilitation) to help us some times for pain of menstruation or low blood pressure when occurs some times during menstruation*

<sup>17</sup> Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan and UNICEF (2010, draft) 'Guideline on promotion of menstruation health and hygiene for trainers and supervisors'; and Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan and UNICEF (2010, draft) 'Menstrual health and hygiene for adolescent girls in middle and high schools'

<sup>18</sup> Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan (2010) 'Assessment of knowledge, attitude and practice of menstrual health and hygiene in girls schools in Afghanistan'

<sup>19</sup> This is myth believed to be related to the women becoming infertile if they wash during menstruation if they wash their bodies, which the evaluator has not heard of in other countries

### **Good practice in Menstrual Hygiene Management and WASH**

Good practice which is emerging internationally in relation to what the WASH sector can do to respond to the menstrual hygiene elements of hygiene and sanitation in their programmes includes:

- Provision of basic information to girls in schools about menses and how to best keep themselves healthy during this period
- Provision of training materials for teachers (or trusted females in the community) on how best to support girls in this issue
- Improvement of water, sanitation and hygiene in schools for girls including ensuring adequate privacy and dignity for the girls to look after their hygiene needs during menses, including also water in the toilets and a disposal mechanism for used sanitary materials
- Inclusion of information for mothers on good practices for health and hygiene during menstruation for their own use and sharing with female relatives and their daughters
- Supporting women's groups to make re-usable sanitary pads that they can sell at a cheap cost to other women and girls, or to make soap that can also be made available at low cost

### Evaluations of ACF projects in Afghanistan

After realising some of the challenges being faced for the female evaluator to speak with women during the evaluation in Ghor Province, the evaluator had a quick look at three previous evaluations undertaken for ACF projects in Afghanistan to see how the evaluators responded to the gender issue as part of their evaluations and analysis. All three of the evaluators made some comment on gender issues, such as noting the difficulty or impossibility of being able to speak to women directly as male evaluators. In two of the cases a female staff member based in Kabul assisted by visiting women as part of the evaluation, which was a good strategy. In Dai Kundi province the evaluator noted the less conservative gender relations of the Hazara men and women. In all three the gender issues were only mentioned in a few limited places with one evaluator recommending a comprehensive gender analysis be undertaken. It was obvious from the evaluations that the challenge for all evaluators, but particularly male evaluators to be able to speak to women beneficiaries and even staff in the remoter programmes.

In addition when meeting the representative of the Provincial Governor, that when monitoring or assessments are done by the Government they are usually done through men speaking to men, unless on the occasion they have a woman on the team. The Provincial government does have women on the overall decision making bodies (head of the Ministry for Women's Affairs, a Provincial Consultant on Women's Affairs, a medical doctor) and also it was

### *Women's views on whether they should be consulted as part of evaluations*

*As part the evaluation of the ECHO funded Ghor Province WASH programme, sustained efforts were made to be able to speak to women beneficiaries, even though the evaluation was undertaken from the provincial capital and women beneficiaries were unable to travel to meet the evaluator.*

*In the end three women beneficiaries spoke to the evaluator by SKYPE from the ACF office in the district town with one way video to allow the women to see the evaluator, but not the other way around (as photographing women in Afghanistan is not always permitted). The discussion was supported by a male translator and a male office staff member at either end.*

*At the end of the interview, the final question posed to the three women, was to note that the evaluator was aware that it was quite difficult for the women to travel to the district centre to speak to the evaluator by SKYPE because of security and other reasons; so she wondered if next time they would recommend that the evaluator should ask again to speak to women or whether the evaluator should only ask to speak to men who would speak on behalf of the women.*

*The women responded without any hesitation 'no they must speak also to the women'.*

noted that there are higher levels involved in the provincial coordination mechanisms for the health sector.

In light of these observations and the experiences of the current evaluator, it is recommended that ACF internationally should re-consider the expectations it has for evaluations in a context with a high level of gender disparity such as Afghanistan. If it is to fulfil its own gender mainstreaming policy and not reinforce the exclusion for women in Afghanistan, involving women in each stage of the projects including in monitoring and evaluation, ensuring that mechanisms are established for women to be able to contribute their skills and opinions, should be a non-negotiable for all ACF projects. This may mean increasing budgets to respond to this component but it would be a surprising donor who would refuse additional funds to be spent ensuring the opportunities and voice of women to be included as well as those of men's.

#### Working to increase the opportunities for women in the ACF project in Ghor Province

It is recommended that ACF tries to strategise as to the possible mechanisms to ensure that women's voices can be heard at the various key stages of projects when currently they are absent, or when particular sensitivity is needed to gain women's view such as in relation to menstrual hygiene management. Possible options for this would be to seek out and establish links with organisations and individuals who could be called upon to either work in partnership with ACF, or be asked to engage on a task by task basis also with the involvement of their Mahrams appropriate, such as:

- Experienced Afghani women working for organisations supporting women's empowerment (including the one in Ghor Province with a woman head who also speaks English)
- Afghani women who could act as consultants or specific activities
- Partnerships with other NGOs who have women staff who are active and able to travel to the remote areas on an occasional basis
- Linking up with staff from the health sector in the province, for example during assessments or evaluations, as there tends to be a higher proportion of women engaged in this sector

Discussions with some organisations working on women's empowerment led to the recommendation to support wherever possible women's income generating opportunities and literacy. Whilst ACF is not an organisation which could focus on literacy, there are some possible opportunities that could be investigate perhaps on a trial basis which would also support the overall aims of the WASH programme. In the WASH KAP at the beginning of the ECHO funded project A122, it was noted that the largest proportion of women noted that they did not use soap because it was not available in their village (although the discussions during the evaluation may refute this – see the **Section 4.5.3**). If this is the case then supporting women's group to be able to make soap locally could both become an income generating opportunity for women (in the same way as the pump mechanics who are all men have an opportunity for an income from the project), and also add to the chance of reduction in disease transmission due to poor hand-washing and increase health, hygiene and dignity during menses for the girls and women. Likewise it could be investigated as to whether women's groups would also like to learn how to make low cost re-usable sanitary pads for sale at low cost to girls and women in their own villages and their neighbouring villages.

#### Experience sharing with other NGOs on gender issues and WASH in Afghanistan

It is in some ways surprising that an organisation with programmes the scale of ACFs in a country with such large gender disparities (some of the most extreme in the world), that ACF does not employ a gender expert to provide guidance, support and to monitor the various elements of the ACF programmes across all disciplines. Discussion with OXFAM-GB as a comparative international NGO, but one which works across the humanitarian development divide, but which also has a strong gender focus, it is striking to note that the organisation had done the following:

- Has a gender team of three people working at national level
- It works through partner organisations, each of which is required to employ a gender advisor for the duration of all partnership projects
- It provides gender training to all staff and partners
- Gender is monitored in all elements of its programmes

It would be positive for ACF to spend some time sharing experiences and learning from the OXFAM-GB team to consider how they could improve the consistency of their work to ensure the engagement of women and men in their projects at all stages including monitoring and evaluation.

#### Office and accommodation facilities in ACF field offices

Whilst contemplating the challenges that are faced in remote programmes to access women beneficiaries and to encourage women staff to work in or visit such locations, some observations were also made about the suitability or otherwise of the office facilities in Chaghcharan. Whilst the all male staff working in the office made every effort to make the office a welcoming environment for the female evaluator, there were some elements of the offices layout and design which could be improved in order to make women visitors feel more comfortable and secure. These included:

- There should be a separate toilet for women constructed outside the main hallway of the office. At the present time the door to the toilet and bathroom is situated in the middle of the main hallway where men are often sitting just outside of the door. The toilet should have secure lock.
- The room allocated for the female guest to sleep was separate from the room for the men, but had no lock on the door and the blinds on the window to the outside did not fully close and hence any man who walked by outside would be able to see inside when the light was on.
- The women's only room should have a secure lock on the door and should have blackout curtains on the windows so that no-one can see inside when the light is on.
- There were no disposal facilities for menstrual hygiene materials and hence if a woman visitor had her menstrual period during the time of the visit she would potentially have to carry blood soaked menstrual products back to Kabul or elsewhere with her, meaning also through the customs check. This would be very unhygienic and also culturally inappropriate for women of any nationality.
- There was nowhere private to wash and dry under garments, which was away from locations where the men staff could access.
- There is no-where where women staff can relax and remove their hijab. The one female staff member who visited the office during the evaluation sat in the room allocated for the female visitor to sleep, but men were also accessing this room during the day.

The above could potentially be improved relatively easily through:

- Constructing a small room out of the back door of the office with enough room for two beds for female visitors, to be used as a female only space where female staff can also relax.
- Add access to another toilet accessed only through the women only space.
- Add a walled area at the back of the room with a washing line which could be used for private washing.
- Add a small fire or incinerator that could be operated by the women for both heating water and burning sanitary materials (possibly modified from the current water heater in the uni-sex toilet and bathroom in the office) or in a model as designed in UNICEF supported schools with an incinerator installed directly from the toilet. See the photo below.

It is recommended that ACF should undertake a process of involving female staff (Afghani and international) in an assessment of all offices to make sure that they are suitable and comfortable for women staff who may work there or visit on an occasional basis.



### 4.2.2 Security in Ghor Province

The Province of Ghor is an insecure area and it has been noted that the security has been getting worse over the past year with AOG presence increasing over the district. Currently all of the staff in Ghor Province are from Ghor Province although most of them came from the initial programme districts of Teywarah and Pasaband and moved to Du Layna and Shahrak when the WASH programme moved.

National staff expressed that they feel vulnerable in their work with one of the first things a female CHP noted was how uncomfortable she felt with the security situation and the road from the district to the provincial centre. Certain more remote areas that were previously easily accessible are now no longer as accessible and a number of staff have left (WASH, other sectors and logistics / admin) noting security related concerns as the main reason.

International staffs have not been allowed to visit the full range of projects for some years and have been limited to the Provincial Capital of Chaghcharan. Because international staff have not been able to travel outside of the Provincial town and the Ghor programme team is seen to be stronger than the Samangan and Kabul programmes, more attention has been given to visiting and supporting these other two programmes. No visits have been made to the Ghor Programme since the end of 2010 when the WASH Co-ordinator was able to visit a few village projects near to the district centre of Du Layna.

It was noted that the programme has not been facing challenges from political pressure for working in one area over another, possibly because the ACF programmes have a large coverage of villages and hence have a visible presence in a large proportion of the district.

The limited ability for international staff to travel to the project villages for some time, concerns for national staff to travel in some areas, and limited visits to the Provincial office by both national and international staff, has had implications for support and monitoring, including no ability for verifying the outputs of the programme. Whilst in general it is believed that the programme is progressing well, reports and data coming out of the programme have tended to be considered to be perfect and that everything is progressing to plan. The perfect nature of the data and reports has highlighted some concern that the data may not all be real, as it is unusual for any programme to always achieve perfectly to plan. But the security situation had meant that on-site visual checks by those outside of the programme have been difficult.

### 4.2.3 Remote monitoring

#### Current assessment and monitoring data systems

A number of systems are being used by the current programme for monitoring the progress of the work:

- Planning – yearly, monthly, weekly (which are adjusted depending on the progress)
- Daily activity sheets – separate ones used by the construction staff, the social mobilisation staff and the HP staff – these include details of who went where, what they did and key people they met as well as motorbike or vehicle use – the forms are signed off by the WASH PM
- There are various activity specific assessment or monitoring tools such as the assessment tool for hygiene practices and one for the use of the BSF which seems to be quite detailed
- The WASH PM then collates all of the assessment and monitoring data into spreadsheets for use to compile progress reports for forwarding on to Kabul and for use in compiling reports for the donor

Observations on the current systems:

- Document the existing monitoring systems - It would be useful to document the current systems so that the Kabul staff are aware of the documentation that can form part of the evidence of work completed
- Improving accuracy of data collection & support for the same – Whilst a significant amount of effort has been made by the WASH PM and the Logistics / Admin team at Chaghcharan to keep detailed records of projects and progress, a number of inaccuracies were noted in some of the spreadsheets, which were minor but would cause concern if an auditor came to assess the project and are more important because the programme is not being monitored on a regular basis by staff from Kabul due to security concerns. It would be positive to provide more support to the project manager for the documentation of the project progress and monitoring, by adding another

management staff member to take on this task, by having an M&E person based in Kabul to undertake regular checking of data, and also cross-checking in the field, perhaps on a quarterly basis

- Recording of HP activities - The HP activity and beneficiaries reached data was not accurate, in that all villages noted 20 visits / activities and every single member of the villages both men and women were noted as having been reached. It is accurate that all of the families have probably been reached with the hygiene kits which has included a small hygiene leaflet, but the number of sessions being the same is a very unlikely situation considering some villages are small, some are larger, some have whole villages sessions with women and some in smaller groups etc which would mean different numbers of sessions per village. Also some people are likely to be away from the village at the time of the activities and some may not have engaged. The WASH PM noted that these were average figures, but the figures show optimum coverage. This area should be looked at in a bit more detail, but it should also be acknowledged that to record exact number of people per activity and to collate these on a regular basis, would be very time consuming and probably not feasible with the current number of management staff on the project, with most of the documentation work falling on the shoulders of the WASH PM. See later for suggestions for additional support in this aspect
- Inconsistency of names of villages and people's names – It became clear during the evaluation that there were challenges off trying to match names, positions and villages of the beneficiaries met, between those provided in Dari and transcribed into English by the translator with the various records of the projects and the names of the water committee members etc. Only half of the participants and village names could be matched up with the lists of project details, even with the assistance of two Head of Base (by this point in the evaluation all of the WASH team had left for Eid break). It was clear that the beneficiaries had been in villages where projects had been implemented as they were able to answer multiple questions on the projects. But it was not possible to triangulate them back with the documented data. This highlighted a key gap in the programme documentation and led to a discussion with the WASH Advisor and Head of Base in Chaghcharan over ways forward. The translations between Dari and English can lead to different spellings and parts of names and village names being documented. It was proposed that it would be very helpful for tracking work undertaken if all villages were given a unique code (which would not vary depending on the sector of the project or the year of the project), they should all use the initially agreed English spelling of the name of the village (linked to the unique code) and also mapped on Google earth. See later for more discussion on this.

#### GPS mapping on Google earth and coding of all villages

As noted above it is recommended that each village should be given a unique code and a standard English spelling of the village name that is referenced across all projects and years. This can be mapped on Google Earth and used to track all activities and be used as a tool to determine areas yet unserved. If the data can also be obtained on the ethnic mix of people in districts, sub-districts or villages, this information could also be over-laid across all ACF programmes to ensure appropriate balance of support is given across communities with different ethnic backgrounds.

It was noted by the WASH Manager that there is an NGO IMAP already working in Afghanistan who could be used to assist with this exercise. GPS data may already be available for all villages in Ghor Province from the CHA village data which is more comprehensive than the data from the villages for the winter kit assessment. It will be useful to cross-check the GPS data of ACF and CHA.

#### Peer review

The ACF strategy for Afghanistan includes a strategy to use other organisations for a process of peer review of the ACF projects. In the context of Ghor Province where it has not been possible for international or national Kabul based staff to visit project villages, a regular process of peer monitoring could be useful for both monitoring progress, challenges etc as well as for mutual learning and sharing approaches and ideas. This could be developed with CRS for example who also work on WASH in the province, or could be undertaken by an organisation such as OXFAM which has a strong gender focus to its work, on an occasional basis to promote learning, discussion and sharing of ideas.

#### Photos

Photos provide a very useful means of evidence of the project processes and outputs. A range of photos were made available for the evaluator, some of which had already been sorted and some of

which were in sub-folders by area. There were many photos of the water point construction and finished, and a range of the training on latrine slab construction. There were very few of latrines, none inside latrines, none of the school latrines, and limited for hygiene promotion activities.

However there is a possible challenge in that it is sometimes sensitive to photograph people in the context of the AOGs, as they are reported to not support photography and also can provide evidence of the involvement of the community in an NGO project. Women may also not always be willing / able to be photographed (refer back to the gender section above) which makes the project photographs very male focussed.

Photos provide a useful opportunity for production of evidence when remote monitoring a programme. If it is confirmed that photographs do not make people less secure, then it would perhaps be useful to structure the photographic evidence in a way that provides photographic evidence of all activities in all villages, for example:

- At the end of the project implementation of the well project, the full Water Committee is pictured standing next to their completed well along with the details and date engraved into the concrete platform
- Each key stage of the project photographed in each village
- If disposable cameras are still available<sup>20</sup> and it is possible to print from the pictures in Afghanistan, another idea which could be considered would be to give the Water Committee a camera each to document the project in their village and then if appropriate giving one set of the printed photos to the village to keep and one set for ACF for evidence of the project achievements

#### Visits and support from Kabul

The WASH team in Kabul is understaffed with the WASH Co-ordinator post being vacant for several months. Because the Ghor Province programme is considered to be stronger than the other two programmes with a more experienced Programme Manager, limited attention has been given by the Kabul team to supporting the Ghor Programme at Ghor level, rather focussing on the other two programmes. The previous WASH Co-ordinator is thought to have visited Ghor and also to visit a few of the projects very near to the district centres of Du Layna / Shahrak, in the last few months of 2010, but no visits from the WASH team have been made since this time to Ghor Province. The WASH Advisor travelled with the evaluator for the full 7 days in the province at the time of the evaluation.

The findings from this evaluation, confirm as much as it was possible, that the programme seems to be achieving a lot in a short time frame and running quite well, but that the Programme Manager could benefit from some additional support, such as:

- Recruiting a bright young school leaver who speaks English to be trained up to support the WASH PM in his daily management tasks;
- Quarterly visits for checking progress and monitoring data, photos and documentation for the projects as well as discussing challenges and solutions;
- Technical design support and on the ground monitoring of the technical quality of the projects by the WASH engineer based in Kabul.

#### Evaluation

As can be seen from the limitations section of this report, the evaluation faced a number of limitations, which were related to the security situation and procedures, the timing of the evaluation falling the week running up to Eid at the end of Ramadan and the fact that the evaluation had to be undertaken remotely from the Provincial centre.

Considering that the evaluation was to be a remote evaluation, the challenges faced could have been lessened if the following had been considered:

- The rule that for security reasons the team in the field were only told the day before the evaluator was to travel to Ghor Province that the visitors were coming and hence they did not have any time to pre-arrange any visits by community members or meetings, did not seem necessary considering the evaluator and the WASH Advisor were not allowed to travel out of the Provincial centre. The main purpose of this rule it is understood is to reduce the likelihood of threats to the international staff travelling to the province. However, considering that the international staff

---

<sup>20</sup> Disposable cameras are available on the web for £2.45 for 27 exposures, but they would need to be located in Afghanistan to be most useful

remained in the Province for 7 days, if a threat was going to happen, the 7 days would have been adequate time for the plan to have been formulated and carried out (although the Provincial Centre is seen as low risk for this to occur). Hence it would not have harmed their position if the news had been told to the team some days in advance and this would have relieved stress from the team and allowed them to more effectively plan for the evaluation.

- It should have been ACF Policy and written into the Terms of Reference that the evaluator should speak with both men and women during the evaluation, and as this is difficult in the Afghanistan context, the ACF Afghanistan team should have been pre-prepared with arrangements for a female translator from Kabul to travel with the evaluator (with her Mahram as appropriate), plus also to have worked out a mechanism for the evaluator to be able to speak with women and men as part of the evaluation.
- The final KAP had been completed.
- The team had been given more notice to prepare, by village to ensure that the final KAP had been analysed, the photographic evidence was sorted and included all elements of the project (including the school latrines) and more time was allocated with the WASH team working on the programme.

Considering the situation of remote management, monitoring and evaluation for the Ghor WASH Programme, what is being done now and the current gaps, a framework of recommendations for remote monitoring for discussion and development has been proposed. Refer to **Annex VI** for the table as well as some points on good practice for remote monitoring.

#### 4.2.4 Targeting of vulnerable groups

The process of targeting of vulnerable groups was considered an example of best practice.

<b>Title of Best Practice</b> (max 30 words)	Process for targeting of vulnerable groups for winter kit distribution
<b>Innovative Features &amp; Key Characteristics</b> (what makes the selected practice different?)	<p>The detailed process of identifying and selecting the very poorest people from the communities for the distribution of a winter kit. Government agencies were also involved in the process and approved of the methodology. Everybody spoken to considered that the kits really did reach the extreme poor and were of great benefit during the winter months.</p> <p>The assessment process was undertaken without the communities knowing the purpose. This both meant that the resources went to the very poorest, as there was no political manipulation by the more powerful in the community to re-direct the resources to the more wealthy, but it also meant that there were many complaints from those who did not receive the kits after they realised what the targeting had been for and the value of the kits. In reflection and in discussion with the team, the methodology could be modified to be more transparent with the communities but also formalising the methodology with them to minimise future kits going to the less needy.</p>
<b>Practical / Specific Recommendations for Roll Out</b> (how can the selected practice be replicated more widely)	<p>This depends on ACFs interest in replicating or promoting it.</p> <p>It could be documented and shared in co-ordination forums in Kabul and likewise to other country offices through the standard ACF meetings or learning forums. Other country experiences could also be requested to build on and strengthen the approach.</p>

Refer to the section which follows for more details.

#### Winter kit distribution – example of good practice

ACF had an element of the programme focussed specifically on the needs of vulnerable groups to support them with NFIs to help aid their situation in the winter.

**Table 3 - Contents of 'Winter Kit' and 'Shelter kit' distributed to vulnerable families**

<b>Contents of the 'Winter kit'</b>	
<b>Family kit –</b> 1 shawl for male; 2 sweater boys; 1 sweater women; 2 sweater girls; 1 rubber boots boys; 1 socks male; 1 socks female; 2 socks boys; 2 socks girls; 2 gloves boys; 2 gloves girls 1 rubber shoes for adults	<b>Hygiene kit –</b> 2 bars of soap (200g, Dettol) 1 plastic box for soap 1 laundry soap for washing clothes and sanitary cloths (400g) 2 small sized towel (30 x 60cm) 1 bottle of liquid chlorine 2 x 10 litre collapsible jerry can 1 plastic mug for drinking of water 1 Aftaba (plastic jug with spout), 2 litres 7 tooth brushes (4 small, 3 large) 2 tube of toothpaste (125g) 4 sachets of ORS Cloth bag 5 Soft cotton cloth (1m x 1m) dark colour
Blankets – 4 per family (China, 5 kg)	30 litre cooler bucket with tap
Charcoal – 50 kg per family	1 Manqual 1 fan for Manqual 1 pliers for Manqual
<b>Content of the 'Shelter kit' (estimated as being needed by 1/5 of the most vulnerable families)</b>	
Tent (UNHCR)	Plastic sheet for windows protection

The team went through a process of visiting a large number of villages in both districts (noted to be all villages but later this was not clear because of variations in the data received from three sources – see **Section 4.4.1**). ACF visited a total of 237 villages in the two districts, and went through a detailed process of assessment to identify the poorest families.

The process involved the following steps and also involved ANDMA representatives in the teams undertaking the assessment:

- The elders were asked to provide a list of the most vulnerable families in the village (without having informed them of the purpose of the information collection)
- There was a process of visiting the homes of the vulnerable families identified and verifying how poor they were versus a set of questions over resource ownership, which included also taking photos of the families' houses<sup>24</sup>
- The beneficiaries were compared using an excel spreadsheet and using scoring criteria and selection was made
- ANDMA and the Governor's Office were informed of the selected beneficiaries
- The communities were informed of the planned distribution
- The NFI kits were put together
- The distribution was undertaken

The data collection included a grading of families as:

- Rich
- Not rich but with enough income
- Poor
- Very poor
- Extremely poor

The selection of the most vulnerable families was therefore an impartial system of selection using scoring versus established criteria, undertaken with the support of the WASH Co-ordinator in Kabul using the data collected from the field. As the communities also did not know the purpose of the data collection at the time, this also reduced the bias in the process.

<sup>24</sup> Noted to have been done for all, but only a proportion of the photos were available to the evaluator

The result of the targeting in this way is that the Winter Kits would really have reached the very poorest members of the communities and hence have been likely to have had a significant impact.

However, whilst the targeting process was detailed and comprehensive, it did however lead to a significant amount of problems for the team when the community leaders and other members of the communities when they saw the size and value of the kits, hence complained about also not being allocated kits themselves.

Reflection from the team after the process also noted that in hindsight one of the challenges was that the difference between those who received the kit and those who did not was often quite limited.

During the evaluation it was discussed that in order to not lose the benefit of the process of effectively targeting the poorest with limited resources, that the following could be undertaken to adapt the process so that it would be more acceptable to the leaders and other members of the population:

- i. To reduce the size of the kits to the essential items so as to be able to spread the benefit to more families;
- ii. To bring all of the community leaders together in one meeting to discuss the methodology for the identification of the poorest people in the communities and the process of scoring and ranking and get their approval in a group to proceed with this methodology;
- iii. To undertake the process and document well the scoring and final selection of families so that if questions are raised afterwards this can be used as evidence of the fairness of the selection procedure;
- iv. Continue to keep a photographic record of the families houses (as long as this is acceptable to the families concerned).

This method is open to more abuse than the initial method as people who know the procedure can inform the assessors that they own less than they actually do, but hopefully it should still reach the majority of poorest people leading to a wide impact.

Photographs of the winter kit distribution can be found in **Annex IV**.

#### Allocation of demonstration latrines

It was not clear that the main WASH programme had a particular focus on the needs of particularly vulnerable groups. For the few discussions held relating to the demonstration latrines (with staff and beneficiaries) it appears that they have been allocated to either a family who is living in the centre of the village and hence does not easily have access to ground on which to defecate or have been allocated as some form of communal latrine.

#### Children with disabilities and school latrines

It was noted that the school latrines have a ramp to improve accessibility for children with disabilities, but the evaluator was not able to verify this as no photos were shown the final latrines. Additional information was provided to the team (WEDC WASH for people with disabilities manual) for additional features that should be included for school or household latrines to improve accessibility, such as hand-rails, additional space and a cleanable seat.

#### *Criteria used for scoring to identify vulnerability:*

- Number of dependents
- Gender head of family
- Number of dependent children Under 5 years
- Number of people with disabilities
- Number of elders
- Land – irrigated
- Land – rain-fed
- Livestock
- Fruit trees
- Monthly income
- Debt
- Remittances
- Support from the community
- Quantities of material for heating the house
- House ownership
- Roof leakages
- Cracks in the walls
- Enough space in the house
- State of the windows

### Considerations of vulnerable groups in the contributions to the water point fund and for the construction of latrines

Due to the limitations in time with the community members and with the WASH staff in Ghor, the issue of how communities responded to the most vulnerable people who may not have been able to contribute the sum per household for the water fund or how they would be supported to build latrines was not investigated by the evaluator. The teams should however be discussing these issues with the communities and supporting discussions on ways to ensure that the most vulnerable can still access water supply, sanitation and soap.

### 4.3 Impact

The post project KAP data had not been analysed at the time of the evaluation and hence was more difficult to assess the potential impact, but all of the beneficiaries met / spoken to from Du Layna District (met in four separate groups) highly appreciated the project and noted that they had experienced a reduction in sicknesses and diseases since the project had been implemented. They also noted a reduction in time to collect water, which also has particular relevance in the winter when walking long distances can be dangerous, and an increase in the amount of water that they use on a daily basis.

The evaluator was only able to talk to one beneficiary of a winter kit and this was in the presence of other people, and hence it was difficult to ask too many in-depth questions. But he expressed it had been very valuable to his and other families, particularly the items such as blankets as these kept the family warm during the winter. Other beneficiaries met explained that the people to whom it had been issued in their villages had also highly valued the kit, but also noted that more people would have liked to have been issued with it.

No data was available on how many latrines had been constructed since the trainings or maintenance condition of the demonstration latrines although some of the beneficiaries noted that some had been built post the training intervention.

The two teachers met noted school hygiene promotion training had been undertaken but one noted that they did not have latrines supported in their school and the other noted that the latrine was not yet finished. It was therefore not possible to comments on the quality, completion or impact of the school sanitation and hygiene activities.

### 4.4 Activities and coverage

#### 4.4.1 Population and villages

##### Total population and number of villages in Du Layna and Shahrak Districts

It was not possible to confirm the total number of people and the total number of villages in the districts of Du Layna and Shahrak, as data from three different sources did not align. Refer to the table below.

#### *Impact of the project*

*Two women beneficiaries explained that before the project they would walk between 1 to 1.5 hours to collect water and the other woman beneficiary used to walk for half an hour to collect water. Now they all walk less than 5 minutes for water. One of the women noted that before she used to collect 5 or 6 buckets a day on her head and using animals. Now she can collect as she needs the water and collects between 8 to 10 per day.*

*(Women beneficiaries from Shaidon, Garak and Gerd Holang villages, Du Layna District)*

**Table 4 - Variations in population data and number of villages in Du Layna and Shahrak Districts**

	Du Layna District		Shahrak District		Total	
	Population	Villages	Population	Villages	Population	Villages
Census data, 1386 (2004)	38,885	105	68,400	181	107,285	286
CHA database	44,407	135	63,933	208	108,340	343
ACF winter kit assessment database, 2010	61,853	125	80,843	112	142,696	237

The ACF data from the Winter Kit assessment which was noted to have been undertaken in all villages, noted the largest population (approximately 30% more than the CHA database and the census), but has a lowest number of villages (30% less than the CHA database, 17% less than the census data). It is possible that this could have been due to unclear boundaries of villages or over-estimations of the population of each of the villages by the communities themselves, but this cannot be confirmed by this evaluation. More attention is needed to clarify this issue over the coming period which would be usefully done as part of the process of documenting the villages by unique village code number and plotting on Google Earth.

Villages where water projects have been supported during 2009/10 and 2010/11:

It should be noted that during the ECHO projects in 2009/10 and in 2010/11 that a total of 116 + 125 villages will have received some form of water project. This means that a total of 241 villages will have received water projects of some form (new well, rehabilitated well, spring and gravity flow, biosand), and hence if the ACF winter kit assessment data is correct, ACF will have reached every village already at least once. This does not mean that all of these villages has been covered adequately as for the two ECHO funded projects only one water point was constructed or rehabilitated in each village of any size, and hence there is still work that needs to be done to reach the Government standard of a maximum number of people per water point. But if the CHA database or the census data is used then there are still villages where ACF has not yet implemented any water projects.

**4.4.2 Selection of project villages**

An assessment was undertaken of the possible project villages during August 2010 for the Project. A site selection database of 182 villages was provided with a range of information collated including the population numbers, number of widows and people with disabilities, common diseases, water sources, time to collect water, whether other organisations have worked in the village previously, and a range of other information including whether the community are willing to participate in the project. A high level of detail has obviously gone into the assessment, and probably to ensuring the most vulnerable villages had been selected, but unlike the winter kit scoring system, it was not possible to identify how the project villages were selected from the 182 noted from the information provided during the evaluation from the documentation. It was noted that the criteria for the water point construction or rehabilitation was: access to water and sanitation; if they have received support before; number families in the village; and remoteness. For the biosand villages they were selected considering: less than 20 families; access to surface water; and remoteness. The team are encouraged to take the time to document how selections are undertaken for future projects, which will help if the selection is ever questioned for political reasons or by the donor.

The ECHO project report and the spreadsheet of the selected project villages indicate that there were no latrines in the project villages before the project. The beneficiaries however indicated that some of the richer people in the villages did have latrines before the project estimated at 10% of the households in some villages. It is possible that the latrines that existed where of a traditional design and hence not considered as a latrine by the assessment team, but the data should have been documented even if the latrines were of a traditional design. The evaluator could not however visit the villages to check this situation to confirm or otherwise. The team is encouraged for future assessments to double check the presence of all types of latrines.

#### 4.4.3 KAP survey before and after the project

A KAP survey was undertaken at the beginning of the project, which was completed in all villages across a number of months, with the data collection being noted in the survey document as being undertaken between 10/01/2010-15/10/2010 (average date as 18/7/10), but verbally noted as having taken place in July and August 2010.

The KAP survey looked at household profile, water collection, water storage, personal hygiene, latrines and defecation, diarrhoea and other water borne diseases, food storage and kitchen hygiene. The survey was undertaken using random sampling within a community using a spinning pen and selecting every third household. It was noted that the survey was undertaken in 30 clusters randomly selected from the 106 targeted villages (the villages for the well projects or spring and gravity projects).

The survey was undertaken by asking questions by the women hygiene promoters. 53% of the respondents were male and 59% were female.

Key observations from the initial KAP:

- 58.8% of the households have between 8 to 14 members living in their family
- 100% of the families visited were of Tajik ethnic origin<sup>25</sup>
- Average income per year [for the family? - this was not specified] mean = 29,988 Afghanis (USD 600) with 2% less than 3,000 Afghanis (USD 60) and 7.8% above 55,000 Afghanis (USD 1,100)
- 83% of the respondents noted that they do not spend anything on healthcare in an average month
- 77% said their water source was a river and 22% said it was an irrigation canal
- On average it takes 49% of the families about 15 minutes to go and collect water and come back, and 45% about 30 mins and on average they collect water 3.5 times a day
- Only 5% of the containers used for transporting water have a cap or lid, 95.5% of the containers used to store water in the home are not covered although 76.8 have a narrow mouth
- 97% of people do not boil their water before drinking
- 100% of people responded that they wash their hands before eating but with water only
- Only 3.6% of respondents noted washing their hands after using the latrine and 0% mentioned after cleaning a baby
- When asked why those that do not use soap do not use it – 3.6% said it is too expensive, 26.8% said it was not necessary and 70.5% noted that it is not available
- There was very limited knowledge on WASH related diseases and they mostly use traditional medicines if a child has diarrhoea (0% said they use ORS) and 94.6% said they did not know how to avoid diarrhoea
- 100% of the families said they do not have a latrine in their yard

A few observations / recommendations re the KAP:

- It was positive that female hygiene promoters have been used for the survey which means that they could ask questions to women as well as to men
- A good range of questions have been considered including some relating to the why people do or do not practice good hygiene practices such as washing hands with soap
- It would also be useful to disaggregate the responses given by men and women respondents to see if there are differences which could give an indication of the hygiene practices or knowledge by gender which can help in appropriately targeting hygiene promotion activities and information

---

<sup>25</sup> This is in a Province with 58% Tajik population. The focus on only villages with people of Tajik origin was noted because 100% of the populations of the districts of Du Layna and Shahrak are Tajik. Data is needed to confirm this and also to consider future locations of projects in relation to the ethnic mix of populations supported in all projects in Afghanistan to ensure a mix of people supported.

- It would be good to ask for gender disaggregated data in some questions, for example to know who collects the water in the summer and in the winter months and for what proportion of the time – women, men, boy children, girl children
- It would be good to investigate the issue of soap a bit more, by also asking about the presence of soap for other purposes such as for body washing or clothes washing and also to ask to see the type of soap (which will confirm its presence and the type)

#### 4.4.4 Planned activities and those reported to be completed

A table of planned activities and those reported to be completed along with evidence that the activities have been completed with comments, is included in **Annex V**.

##### Evidence of the completion of the projects

In the context of a remote evaluation the evaluator was not able to visit project areas and hence was unable to personally confirm the numbers reported as completed above. The final KAP had also not been analysed and hence it was not possible to know the reported improvement of hygiene good practice or latrine construction.

However, photos were available for some of the hygiene promotion activities, a few latrines, some of the latrine training, some of the beneficiaries of the winter kit receiving the training associated with it, and a range of the water points at various stages of construction including the signboards indicating ACF / ECHO and markings in the concrete platform. But the photos were not all labelled by village and considering the challenge correlating the names and villages of the people met with the project records, it could be quite possible that correlating the photo names and project villages may also have posed similar problems. The need for the standardisation of names, mapping on Google Earth and peer review and follow up by Afghan staff from Kabul on the ground are all recommended.

The evaluator had the opportunity to however meet or speak with a total of 16 male and 3 female beneficiaries from 17 villages and all confirmed that the water projects were completed and could answer questions also on the sanitation and hygiene components which provide additional evidence that the projects have been completed as reported. The evaluator also had the chance to speak to a total of 14 male staff and 1 female staff member from the Ghor Province admin/logistics and WASH teams which helped to clarify processes undertaken during implementation of the project.

##### School latrine construction

The only component where the information did not correlate from different sources was in relation to the latrine construction at the schools:

- It was noted that the school latrine construction was only completed in the last month of the project and no photos were taken as the camera was broken and hence there were no photographic evidence of their completion.
- The information which was given by the two teachers met also did not correlate with the written records:
  - One teacher from Bidak Jalal, noted that he worked at a primary school with 250 girls (grade 1 to 9) and that the school has 2 male teachers. He noted that the school was provided with one latrine block of 6 units but that the construction was not yet completed. On the records of the school latrine construction, it was noted that the school was a girls school but only had 88 students, had 7 teachers and had 2 latrine blocks constructed (it was not clear from the record sheet if it was 2 latrine blocks of 3 cells or 2 latrine blocks of 6 cells). This school was not included on the recorded list of schools where hygiene promotion was undertaken, but the teacher reported that the staff and some of the brighter students were given hygiene promotion together.
  - Another teacher from Tarbolagh primary school noted that they had 23 students mixed boys and girls (from grade 1 to grade 6) and that they did not have any latrines constructed at their school. This correlated with the list in that the Tarbolagh school was not noted to have latrines, but the record for the school where hygiene promotion training was undertaken note that there were 254 students in the school and it was a boys school.

- The document confirming the progress vs time of the various activities also only noted: '10' completed versus the '60' planned, but it was noted verbally that this was an error and indicated 10 blocks (of 6 cells) had been completed.

Because of the lack of consistent information and evidence of the completion of the school latrine construction it is recommended that the ACF Engineer should visit all of the schools where latrines were constructed to confirm their completion and the quality of their construction.

## 4.5 Relevance / appropriateness and effectiveness

### 4.5.1 Water supply

#### Relevance / appropriateness

The support of newly constructed or rehabilitated wells plus the national standard handpump (Afridev), construction of spring catchments with gravity flow, and biosand filters for households in smaller villages are all relevant interventions for the context. The methods for implementation of all of the water technologies are simple, so good for replication in short time frame in multiple villages and also systems that it is possible for communities to operate and maintain at household or community level with only occasional outside support.

It was clear from the discussions with the community that they were involved in process from beginning to end – both men and women noted they had been involved in the selection of the site for the water point and they described the raising of an initial sum of money for maintenance and how they would collect additional money if they had a problem that cost more than this sum of money collected. There was one strange occurrence during the evaluation where all of the three groups of men from the villages noted that they did not dig the wells; and those where a pipeline was installed for a spring and gravity supply system noted they were paid daily labour for the digging of the trenches (paid 20 Afghanis for 1m at 0.5m deep); whereas in the MoU with the villages it notes that digging the well to static water level is a requirement from the community and the staff also confirmed that the communities dug the wells to static water level. The women however confirmed that the community had been involved in digging the wells.

The photos of the construction process indicate a variation in the digging procedures and health and safety of the digging process. In some cases a tripod is used on the surface which can be used to haul up the material or the person down the pit, but others show only a wooden log being used. In no picture are the workers down the well wearing protective headgear (admittedly something that is difficult to ensure in many contexts), and also do not have a safety rope to help pull them out if there is a problem. Children are also seen around the top of the well under construction and there are no bunds or toe boards to prevent materials being kicked into the wells while someone is inside. The safety procedures for digging of the wells should be revisited to ensure that best practices are followed to the best of ACFs capacity.

Training of the Water Committees was undertaken as well as separate training for the male Caretakers and Mechanic (shared by several villages). The women Caretakers did not get the 3 day Caretaker Training as it was noted that they cannot travel to a training and also the tools for the caretakers was issued at the training at which only the men attended. It was noted that the women received some guidance at village level as part of the project implementation.

Two private shop keepers, one in each district town, were supported with a set of spare parts (refer to **Annex III** for the list), which they are expected to sell for an agreed sum, set above the cost of

### *Repairing a hand-pump*

*One beneficiary noted that they had a problem with their pump last winter. They met together as a committee and discussed how to solve the problem. They found a mechanic to come and identify the problem. They then went to the District centre to try and find the spare part but could not find it so they went to a neighbouring village which had the spare part. They paid 7 Afghanis for the spare part. The mechanic came and made the repair. They paid 350-400 Afghanis each time to the mechanic to visit their village which is quite remote. Other villagers noted that for their communities because they are less remote they would pay approximately 200 Afghanis for a visit.*

purchase in Kabul. It was not possible to meet the spare parts suppliers but the community members seemed to know where to go to get the spare parts and to engage a pump mechanic.

Photographs of the water projects can be found in **Annex IV**.

### Effectiveness

The well construction projects seem to have gone well with only minor challenges. The minor challenges can be seen on some photos where it is indicated that there has been a problem with the concrete used for the drainage platform, which on questioning was noted was damaged in the cold weather. Plus it can be seen from the photographs that although the majority of the water points are of a reasonable construction standard, that there are variations with voids in some of the concrete which could be reduced with a closer attention to ensuring the correct concrete mixes and vibration of the concrete to ensure all voids are filled. Special attention needs to be made to ensuring that the concrete is of a correct mix, that if it is being laid in cold weather that additional precautions are taken to ensure the concrete is not damaged by expanding water in its voids as it freezes<sup>26</sup>, and also that there are no opportunities for water to be able to freeze in the concrete gaps which can lead to expansion and cracking and exposure of reinforcement.

It was not fully clear from the photographs which of the pictures represented rehabilitated water points or whether the drainage situation around the rehabilitated water points has been adequately improved. Only a few of the photos had fences constructed around the water point. Whilst it is not essential to fence water point, except where there are animals present in the location, it is good practice to assist to form a clear boundary for hygiene and protection purposes.

The spring protection and gravity flow projects have not been as successful in the sense that communities have reported problems with burst pipes (not at joints). On questioning it was noted that the gravity pipelines had not been surveyed or designed and looking at the photographs it was apparent that the gradients are steep. Also the pipes have been installed at 0.5m when the MRRD standard is 1m deep, which is an appropriate minimum depth in cold weather climates where snow is common. The ACF Engineers from Kabul need to visit each of the gravity systems to undertake a topographical survey (using an electronic level, a rangefinder, Abney Level, or possibly GPS once checking its accuracy for vertical measurements against another method) and to design the pipelines to checking the maximum pressures. Plus then where necessary either install break pressure tanks or replace sections of the pipeline.

The Biosand Filtration units were well appreciated by the communities and the initial tests of the micro-biological water quality were good. From the samples taken from the 120 biosand filters, 93% were found to have zero faecal coliforms per 100 ml sample; 7% had less than ten; and none had more than ten.

The water quality tests pre and post well construction were also very positive:

- Water quality analysis in household containers undertaken as part of the KAP1 (December 2010) = 100% had > 10 faecal coliform / 100 ml, with results ranging from 60 to 400 FC/100ml
- Water quality analysis for the wells after construction (mostly tested in April and May 2011) = 96% with 0 FC/100ml; 3% with < 10 FC/100ml and 0 samples with > 10 FC/100ml

### *Water Committee Structure*

*Water Committees were established for the projects with new wells, rehabilitated wells and spring catchments with the following structure:*

- *Chair (male)*
- *Cashier (male)*
- *Caretaker (male)*
- *Caretaker (female)*
- *Community Hygiene Promoter (male)*
- *Community Hygiene Promoter (female)*

*The female members are often relatives of their counterparts (for example a mother and son as Caretakers).*

<sup>26</sup> Refer to Davis & Lambert, 'Engineering in Emergencies' (p573) or Buttle and Reed, 'Out in the Cold, Emergency Water Supply and Sanitation for Cold Regions' (p55-58) for additional information

- Water quality analysis in household water storage containers (mostly tested in May and June 2011) = 92% with 0 FC / 100ml; 8% with < 10 FC / 100ml and 0 with >10 / 100ml

The Water Committee members met or spoken to (both men and women) came across as confident about their roles and responsibilities and how to solve a problem if there is a breakdown of the handpump.

#### 4.5.2 Excreta disposal

##### Relevance / appropriateness

Development of demonstration latrines was appropriate in that it was the MRRD recommendation to install four per water point, but simply providing training and demonstration latrines has been shown to not be very effective in many contexts to lead to a significant increase in construction of latrines.

The local design of vault latrines have been used with either a standard concrete slab with reinforcement or in the biosand villages a 'square' domed slab. It is not clear to the evaluator that an unreinforced square shaped dome slab will ensure that the concrete will remain in compression to ensure it will not crack and fail. The team were not aware where this design originally came from and whether it has been tested previously although they indicated that it seems strong. It is recommended that the square domed slab should be shared with the University of Kabul and tested for load bearing and durability.

For photographs of the latrine construction refer to **Annex IV**.

The team noted that the vault latrines have a urine separation which in the traditional design simply flows out of the latrine structure into the ground. But it was noted that they add a pipe to direct the urine into the ground in the Kabul latrines. It is not clear from the photos of the latrines from Ghor if this is practiced. It is a good adaptation to help give confidence for women to continue using the latrine during their menstrual period when there may be blood mixed with the urine.

The provision of a plastic sheet for a door to reduce the cost is an appropriate step, but it should still be possible for the door to be locked / fixed when someone is inside to ensure privacy particularly for women and girls. This can be done with a small string and a nail. It would also be positive if ACF are supporting training on latrine options in the future to also show simple adaptations which can be made for people with limited mobility, such as through having a moveable cleanable seat or hand-rail.

The villages with wells were supported with one workshop training and latrine constructed and then three more demonstration latrines constructed and either used as communal latrines or allocated to a family who has less ability to reach the outside of the community for defecating as they are based in the middle of the village. For the biosand villages each household was given a latrine digging kit and one 50kg of cement for a domed slab for constructing their own latrines.

It is positive that the ACF programme are now in the following programme following the revised strategy recommended by the MRRD in the new 2010 WASH Policy to support Community Led Total Sanitation (CLTS) which if undertaken appropriately and it manages to trigger community led action to prevent open defecation, is likely to lead to a much improved coverage than previously constructing demonstration latrines. In Afghanistan the community is being triggered by gender, with women separate to the men, so it will be interesting to see how the ignition process and subsequent action will happen with both groups being triggered separately. Care will also need to be given to the female hygiene promoters to also ensure that they are able and confident to facilitate the process that leads to anger and disgust which then leads to communities wanting to undertake action.

ACF is linked into a national experience sharing group on CLTS at Kabul level which is very positive. CLTS whilst it has a lot of potential for rural communities such as those in Ghor Province with very low coverage levels of latrines will need a change in the level of follow up and support. This will need to be on-going for some time and will need to be budgeted into all new projects to continue providing follow up motivation and support to older communities.

As the concept of CLTS and which is supported by the national WASH policy, 2010, includes that no subsidy should be provided, a range of options for communities to gain ideas from would be beneficial, versus what seems to be one single design of latrine supported at present (urine diversion vault latrine). The houses tend to be constructed with large distances between them so unless there is a strong cultural resistance to doing so, latrines could also be constructed until full as a pit, planting a

tree on the old pit location and then reconstructing the latrine with the same slab in another location. The MRRD has a design for both the dry vault latrine and a pit latrine.

In addition ACF could also consider supporting masons to prepare different slab options for sale and different design latrines to give people ideas as to what they can construct, but their marketing could be difficult considering the distances between houses and villages.

### Effectiveness

Villagers noted that some people have built latrines since the project, but no KAP and no data on latrine construction. It is not expected that the demonstrations will have led to many people having been motivated to build latrines of their own yet at this stage.

The allocation, ownership and operation and maintenance of the demonstration latrines, seemed from the limited opportunity to discuss, to be a weaker point of the programme with unclear ownership of the latrines and hence a high level of risk that the latrines would be poorly operated and maintained. No pictures were available of the inside of the latrines for the evaluator to comment on.

The move to CLTS is a good move as noted above, but there will also be a need to encourage communities to ensure they support most vulnerable families in latrine construction to ensure open defecation free communities.

### 4.5.3 Hygiene promotion

#### Relevance

The ACF team use the materials from the Ministry of Public Health and the Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development for their hygiene promotion activities, guidelines, picture cards and some posters.

The evaluator was not able to fully read the two guidelines produced by the MoPH and the MRRD because they are in Dari, but had the section headings translated. From the headings and the pictures it seems that the approaches mainly focus on trying to persuade people improve their hygiene for the purpose of improving health.

The hygiene promoters work in couples (who are related), which allows female staff to be able to work with female beneficiaries and male staff to work with male beneficiaries. Multiple channels are used for the hygiene promotion work:

- Male promoters meet with men in the mosque or another public place
- Female promoters meet with women in groups in one of the woman's houses
- Male promoters undertake the hygiene promotion in the schools

The ACF Hygiene Promotion Couples also work with a male and female Community Hygiene Promoter, during the 3 days they undertake promotion activities in each village and then the CHPs are meant to continue their activities on a monthly basis with their communities on their own. The Hygiene Promotion Trainer follows up at intervals to receive reports on how many activities they have undertaken. The CHPs are given one kit of 5 flip charts, 2 books, 2 posters, a backpack and the 'River Story Poster'. It is recommended that these materials are reviewed for the CHPs, as it is not clear what the 5 pictures consist of (refer to **Annex V** for the full list of pictures available to the team), the woman and man work separately with women and men, but it is understood that the couple are only given one set (this would need confirming). The evaluator was also unable to work out what the 'River Story Poster' reflected that was relative to a WASH programme or behaviour and hence its purpose should be re-evaluated and potentially replaced with a more relevant poster.

Every family in the project villages were given a hygiene kit consisting of one bar of soap for hand-washing, a leaflet with hygiene messages, a ewer jug and a 20 litre jerry can with tap. These items seem appropriate in response to the gaps identified in the KAP, although the potential for the one bar of soap to prompt the family to continue to buy more after it is used up is debatable (discussed further below).

The hygiene promotion staff met came across as committed to their work (as did all of the staff met from the Ghor Programme) and that they knew most of the materials and methods they are utilising well. From the few photographs available of the hygiene promotion activities in the ACF programme, mostly in the schools, however, the activities seemed mainly to be focussed on information provision and from the lines of students facing the teachers and hygiene promoters looked to be more didactic rather than participatory (the activity was described through translation as a lecture to students).

Because of the limited time available with the hygiene promotion staff (a maximum of 2 hours) it was not possible to go into detail on all of the approaches used and hence some more participatory methodologies may also be used but not identified during the time.

It would be very positive to undertake a more detailed study of the motivators for behaviour change and to learn from those who do already practice good hygiene practice (the 'doers'), such as those who use a latrine and wash their hands with soap at critical times and then to integrate this information into the hygiene promotion activities that ACF undertakes.

It would also be positive to start to integrate good practice information on menstrual hygiene management for women and girls. It is apparent from a MoE / UNICEF supported study in Kabul and a neighbouring province<sup>27</sup> that over 70% of girls do not wash their bodies during their menses, which is believed to be related to a traditional belief that if they do they will become infertile later in life. This practice is of great risk to the health of girls and women, risks infection, as well as being a dignity issue.

Likewise there are other activities which the hygiene promoters could support in the villagers to help the community members be more likely to practice the behaviours such as:

- Demonstrating simple options for hand-washing facilities at the household level (tippy tap, leaky tin, tin with plug forced shut by weight of water etc).
- Varying the promotional methodologies to also include more variety, such as puppet shows, drama, songs, quizzes or drawing for children.
- Other possible activities such as soap making or making of local sanitary pads could also be promoted as a small income generating activity for the women and to help promote improved sanitary hygiene at the same time as ensuring that women are fully engaged in the project.

However, the education level of the ACF hygiene promotion couples, the limited time in each village (3 days) and the fact that the team are trying to reach all members of the community in this time, should also be considered when evaluating the approaches used. If more participatory approaches are used, then it needs to be assessed what is an appropriate time-frame for the activities in each village. Providing a range of activities for the CHPs to use over time may also however give more options to the CHPs to sustain their efforts without the community members getting bored of the five HP cards provided to the couple.

There is an opportunity for innovation as the programme moves to utilising CLTS and the new motivator of shame and igniting the community to action, to expand this to include options related to other key behaviour changes such as constructing hand-washing facilities and purchasing and using soap for hand-washing.

#### Effectiveness:

It is difficult to identify the effectiveness of the hygiene promotion activities without being able to visit the homes of the beneficiaries and as the final KAP was not yet analysed. But the hygiene promoters seem to have been active, and the men in one focus group were able to identify most good hygiene practices from the picture cards by being able to allocate most against pictures of sick or healthy children. There were a few they struggled with including the washing of fruit or the mother depositing the child's faeces into the latrine, but this could also be a misinterpretation of the picture as much as not knowing whether the practice was good or bad.

Whether hygiene practices have changed to a greater degree, such as hand-washing with soap for example, is debatable, with a range of responses coming from the beneficiaries and the initial KAP not triangulating well. It seems that not being able to afford soap is still being used as an excuse for not sustaining hand-washing with soap, but it is believed that the families have soap for other purposes in their houses (body washing and clothes washing), and also it was determined that families even in the very remote villages have to pay a huge sum for their daughters to get married (over USD 10,000 per daughter) and hence this indicates that when they need to most families have ways to raise capital income that could both support soap buying and the construction of a latrine if they were prioritised.

---

<sup>27</sup> Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan (2010) 'Assessment of knowledge, attitude and practice of menstrual health and hygiene in girls schools in Afghanistan'

#### 4.5.4 School hygiene and sanitation

##### Relevance / appropriateness

The Hygiene Promoter team members discussed the use of some picture cards in the schools, and the evaluator was shown some photos in Kabul of children involved in some exercises such as drawing, but didn't have time to go into this much detail with the staff in Ghor. It appears from the photographs that the hygiene promotion activities in schools are mainly in lecture format, although it is noted that child to child health clubs are supported and the clubs are given items such as soap, glasses for drinking, brooms, garbage bins, jerry cans, toilet paper and a water tank for hand-washing. One teacher met noted that they were provided with training along with a few of the brightest pupils but were not given any tools (such as cards or posters) for continuing hygiene promotion teaching after the training.

For photographs of the hygiene promotion activities in schools refer to **Annex IV**.

The programme has documented that it has undertaken hygiene promotion in ten schools and has constructed latrines in 10 schools but the two lists don't seem to correlate meaning that the activities may have been made in different schools.

The information that the two teachers met provided on the activities in their schools and the school sizes also does not correlate well with the programme documentation.

It was noted that the latrines have been designed with a ramp for accessibility for children with disabilities which is positive, but it is not possible to comment on the appropriateness of the ramp design (slope, platforms etc) or the general construction quality without access to photos or designs. Additional information has been provided to the team with additional ideas for improving accessibility such as adding a washable seat, additional space and a hand-rail.

Discussions with the one teacher who said that his girls school has been supported with a block of 6 latrines, noted that the latrine was not yet completed, that there were no hand-washing facilities and he was not fully clear on who will operate and maintain the latrines. He also noted that although it was a girl's school with only male teachers, a separate teachers' latrine had not been supported.

Not clear on the relevance of the supply of toilet paper for the school in relation to sustainability of supply, as most people in a rural community would use water, leaves, sand or other natural products.

It also seems that the school supported was not always in the village of the water project, but rather identified by the Ministry of Education as the schools requiring the support. The programme team noted that water was not considered for the school because the MoE had said that UNICEF is drilling wells for schools. However, this could take many years to reach all schools. Ideally for maximum benefit it would be positive to undertake school WASH activities in schools where there is also a community water, sanitation and hygiene project. The water point can then also support the school as well as the community and be managed by the community Water Committee.

As noted for the community hygiene promotion activities, it is also recommended to add a component on menstrual hygiene management for the older girls in schools. Advice and materials can be obtained from UNICEF and OXFAM-GB on the materials and approaches already developed for Afghanistan.

The school WASH programme needs to be re-visited to consider and improve on the following areas:

- Suitability of number of latrine cells to the number of pupils
- Ensuring that there are also separate latrines constructed for teachers
- Ensuring that the gender separated latrine blocks are well designed and are accessible and appropriate for all children, including smaller children, children with disabilities and adolescent girls
- Ensuring that there is a functional hand-washing facility with soap always present by the latrine
- Ensuring that there is a clear responsibility established for the operation and maintenance of the latrines and on who will pay for any repair, emptying or replacement of the latrines and other WASH infrastructure
- Provision of a water supply and adequate safe storage for drinking water for the children
- Ensuring that the teachers get adequate resource of teaching aids and approaches to keep supporting the children in their hygiene learning over time

- Ensuring that the methodologies supported are child friendly and varied for engaging the children of different ages (games, quizzes, drawing, singing, practical's etc)
- Including separate promotional sessions for older girls on menstrual hygiene management and also for teachers (both male and female) on how to ensure that the school is menstrual hygiene management friendly

#### Effectiveness

It was not possible for the evaluator to confirm any of the data provided on the construction of the school latrines, their completion, the appropriateness of their design, or the quality of their construction. It was also not possible to confirm the effectiveness of the hygiene promotion activities in the schools because no schools could be visited and no children were met during the evaluation.

#### 4.5.5 Winter kit

##### Relevance

The winter and larger hygiene kits were specifically targeted at the extreme poor in each community. Refer to **Section 4.2.4** for further details. The kits aimed to help the extreme poor to better cope with the harsh winter months. 650 families received the winter kit and the larger hygiene kit, and 100 families who had particularly poor housing received tents and plastic for their windows. Refer to **Section 4.2.4** for details of the content of the kits.

The one beneficiary of the winter kit who was met confirmed that it was highly valued in particular items such as the blankets which helped to keep his family warm over the winter. Other beneficiaries met also confirmed the value of the kit to those of whom it was issued but asked that more of the kits should be distributed to more people. There was no time to go into detail about each of the items and their particular relevance of otherwise to the beneficiaries. The kits were developed in line with the content identified at national level. The only immediate observations are that it was positive that cloth for potential menstrual hygiene use was included and that there was only a small amount of soap issued to the families for personal hygiene and clothes washing, considering the average size of the family is 8 persons.

##### Effectiveness

Targeting seems to have been well done to reach the extreme poor using a scientific method for scoring and ranking the potential beneficiaries, although the process caused some political problems for the teams. The kit selection seems to have been generally appropriate, although further discussions with the team identified that if this exercise was repeated that the kit size would be reduced in order to be able to reach more of the poorer members of the community. Refer to **Section 4.2.4** for further details.

## 4.6 Coherence

The project has been implemented in a way that the water, hygiene and sanitation activities have been implemented in the same villages. The ACF team have been using the materials and guidance from the Ministry of Public Health and the Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development for hygiene promotion. They have been following Government guidance on sanitation promotion, including constructing demonstration latrines, but post this project, have now changed to starting to support the CLTS approach in line with changes in Government policy. They are also linked into at Kabul level a learning group for CLTS with other agencies, which is very positive. The team have been reporting regularly to the Government at Ghor level through the regular NGO co-ordination meeting and direct reports to the MRRD.

The beneficiary numbers have been calculated based on the MRRD standard of a maximum of 25 families per water point (assumed to be in the old policy), although the project has limited the number of water points per village to one no matter what the size. This approach is being modified in the follow on project in Ghor Province funded by SIDA to support an appropriate number of water points per the village size.

The school latrine construction and hygiene promotion activities were not fully clear, with some elements being undertaken in different schools and the villages sometimes being different from the other project villages where the community projects were undertaken. The school hygiene and sanitation elements of the project need revisiting, checking and potentially re-designing for future programmes.

The project aligns well with the ACF WASH Policy (2011) internationally and with the ACF Country Strategy for Afghanistan (refer to **Annex III.1 and III.5**).

## 4.8 Efficiency

Total expenditure on the project once the evaluation is complete, will be approximately Euro 690,000. It is estimated by the project that it reached 23,220 beneficiaries, with an ultimate cost including all elements of Euro 29 / beneficiary, or including the materials, equipment and logistics costs only of Euro 424,666 or Euro 18 / beneficiary.

In reality the project probably reached more than 23,220 beneficiaries, because it made assumptions, a) limiting the number of families counted per water point to the recommended number by the MRRD (25 per well, 100 per spring and gravity system) and also that there were only 6 people per family. A number of the villages were of greater size than 25 families but still had one water point (the average number of families per water point was 29) and b) also the average family size was larger. The KAP indicated that the mean family size was 8.54 / median 8.0.

**Table 5 - Calculation of time available for programme work in each village**

<p>Villages with water projects = 125 villages</p> <p><u>Months available for work:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• May &amp; June = unstable (2 months)</li> <li>• Dec – April = winter (5 months)</li> <li>• July – Nov = more stable (5 months)</li> <li>• Ramadan = Aug (1 month)</li> <li>• Hence the total full months of work = 4 months</li> <li>• Total part months = 3 months (insecure months + Ramadan)</li> <li>• Assume the total number of full working days equivalent per year = <math>4 \times 20 + 3 \times 15 = 125</math> days</li> </ul> <p><u>Key team members whose presence will allow core activities to be undertaken (not including supervisors):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Social mobilisation team leaders = 3</li> <li>• HP couples = 4</li> <li>• Masons = 4</li> </ul> <p><u>Calculation of days in each village</u></p> <p>With approximately 125 villages with water projects and 3-4 of each of the key team members (masons, HP couples, social mobilisation team leaders) means less than 4 days can be spent in each per village (say 3) per speciality (social mobilisation, construction of water project / latrine construction trainings, hygiene promotion), plus all trainings also need to be included in these days</p>
--

Considering the remoteness of the Province and the project villages, and the difficult security situation which means that there are very few actors working in the context, the cost of implementing the project seems reasonable and the coverage achieved in such a short time frame is impressive.

Efforts were made to compare procurement plus logistics of key items from Kabul vs procuring them in Ghor for delivery at site (which was not possible using transporters from Kabul who were not prepared to travel into the remote areas) and through managing to reduce the estimated cost of the winter kit an additional 150 families were provided with the winter kit over those whom it was planned.

## 4.9 Sustainability

### Water supply

The evidence of the sustainability of the water supply projects from the few beneficiaries met, was that in the context it has been done quite well, the context being a short time frame for the project to be implemented (effectively 6 months), in an area that is increasingly insecure, where the government and most private sector organisations would not choose to travel, and in remote mountain villages.

It was clear that the men and women met or spoken to had a good understanding of what they will do if they face a problem with the water supply and representatives from one village with a handpump and one with a spring described how they had already solved problems of a broken down handpump or a burst pipe.

Whilst the pump mechanics and the spare parts suppliers were not met as part of the process, the beneficiaries discussed engaging the pump mechanics and how much they pay them, and seemed to know where they could go for spares for their handpumps.

It was not possible fully confirm if the biosand owners will know what to do if the flow rate reduces, and hence it is suggested that it would be positive, either way, if there could be a repeat visit to the communities with the bio-sand filter to revisit the procedure.

It is recommended that ACF should integrate into all future projects a component to undertake follow up monitoring and support to Water Committees, as well as on-going support and updates for the CHPs and to continue to provide on-going support for motivation following the new sanitation promotion approach of CLTS. This would provide on-going evidence of the success of the projects in relation to sustainability for all elements which can also feed into the design of new projects, as well as helping communities to resolve more problems that occur, leading to an overall higher level of sustainability over the longer term. The proportion of the budget for this activity could be between 5-10% of the total budget for new projects.

#### Excreta disposal

It was not clear from the evaluation that the ownership or responsibilities for operation and maintenance were clear for all of the demonstration latrines, particularly those that are being used as communal latrines. This is likely to lead to a number being abandoned in the future. There was no opportunity to speak with owners of new latrines or to know how many new ones have been constructed.

#### Hygiene promotion

The CHPs were trained and were working with the ACF HP Couples and given some HP materials. However it was not fully clear which of the many cards have been given to the couples, and whether there was one set of two. The CHPs are likely to be able to continue to share the HP information after the project had finished although probably would be unlikely to continue for long time without variation in messages / information and approaches as the community members are likely to get bored.

Hopefully communities will sustain improved practices however comments made about not being able to afford soap indicate that the practices may not be sustained, which is a common challenge facing hygiene promotion efforts in many countries.

#### School hygiene and sanitation

The evaluator is not able to comment on the completion or sustainability of the school latrines, as the information available was not consistent. The few discussions held on the school latrines held with a teacher however indicated that the operation and maintenance may not be fully clear.

#### Winter kit

The winter kit consisted of one off donations to very vulnerable families. Due to family ownership use of most items is likely to be sustained although no discussion was held with beneficiaries on the most or least useful items, which may give an indication of their use. Some items were consumables (soap, chlorine, toothpaste) and hence would only have a limited use period.

## 4.10 Other cross-cutting issues

### 4.10.1 Environment

The original project proposal identifies a previous study which indicates that in a study in Pasaband and Taywara districts in 2008 of the 206 water points constructed that only 10 of the wells and 4 springs were dry during the last drought.

For this project the wells were constructed aiming for a 10m water column and a yield of 1 l/s or greater. The results of the 60 the new wells indicate that the average water column in one district is 3.3 m and in the other is 4.2 m. On-going monitoring of the sustainability of all water points from this

project and previous water points is recommended, and if drying out of water points is occurring, ACF should reflect on whether it can deepen its standard wells during initial construction or rehabilitation.

## 5. Conclusions & Recommendations

### 5.1 SWOT and scoring of project versus DAC criteria

**Table 6 - Strengths weaknesses opportunities and threats of ECHO funded WASH programme in Ghor Province, 2010-11**

Strengths	Weaknesses
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Reported impact of the project by the beneficiaries</li> <li>2. Large number of improved water points or BSF filters in a short time-frame leading to a large number of people gaining access</li> <li>3. Engagement of the beneficiary communities in the project at each stage</li> <li>4. Efforts made to ensure the communities are able to sustain their water points and establishment of spare parts outlets</li> <li>5. Efforts to engage women as well as men in the project</li> <li>6. Detailed targeting process for identifying and reaching the extreme poor with supply of the winter kit</li> <li>7. Multiple channels used for hygiene promotion to reach, men, women, children</li> <li>8. Good efforts made on documenting using spreadsheets the progress of the work, names of the water committee members etc</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. No technical design of the gravity supply systems and some variable quality of concrete for well rings, covers and platforms, few fences around WPs</li> <li>2. Not clear ownership of the demonstration latrines</li> <li>3. Not making opportunities for women members of the water committees to gain equal training to their male counterparts</li> <li>4. Sub-office structures not designed to be women friendly</li> <li>5. Limited photographic evidence of parts of the programme – latrines, school latrines, HP activities, involvement of women as well as men</li> <li>6. Some errors in the documented spreadsheets compounded by challenges in being consistent with village names</li> <li>7. Inconsistent evidence on the progress of the school latrine activities</li> <li>8. Policy in engagement of women as well as men could be clearer, including ensuring that monitoring and evaluation engage women as well as men</li> <li>9. No data on ethnicity by district, to support evidence of appropriate targeting of projects</li> </ol>
Opportunities	Threats
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Other NGOs who have strong experience in gender, the involvement of women and in partnerships who could be met to share experienced and approaches (OXFAM-GB)</li> <li>2. NGO with experience in mapping who could be approached to support a coding &amp; mapping exercise of ACF project villages (IMAP)</li> <li>3. Availability of materials on menstrual hygiene management already developed in Afghanistan (UNICEF, OXFAM-GB)</li> <li>4. Other NGOs working in Ghor Province on WASH (CRS and AfghanAid) who can be approached to investigate possible mutual peer review monitoring and experience sharing</li> <li>5. WASH Co-ordination mechanisms in Kabul including opportunities for sharing experiences on CLTS</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Intensity and duration of the winter months</li> <li>2. Insecurity in the districts and on the road between the provincial and district centres</li> <li>3. Increasing pressure on women from AOGs to stop working as staff on the programme</li> <li>4. Women professionals or peer organisations cannot be identified who are prepared to visit the programme villages in Ghor Province for monitoring</li> </ol>

**Table 7 - Scoring table for evaluation of ECHO funded WASH Programme in Ghor Province, A122**

Criteria	Rating (1 low, 5 high)					Rationale <i>Note – it has been difficult to fully assess several of the criteria below due to no access to the programme villages, only limited access to the beneficiaries, no final KAP survey, and hence the scoring is based on estimations and a range of assumptions</i>
	1	2	3	4	5	
Impact				X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Based on assumptions following statements by the beneficiaries alone</li> <li>Impact for water supply expressed in terms of reduced time for collection with particular impact in winter time; Impact for water, sanitation and hygiene expressed as reduced disease by community members;</li> <li>School sanitation and hygiene not included in this criteria as no evidence collected</li> </ul>
Sustainability			X			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sustainability for water points = 4 due to trained personnel, villagers knew what to do if there was a problem; availability of trained mechanics that have been used already; not clear on the spare parts chain due to lack of information; but not enough time to assess villagers ability to sustain bio-sand filters; some problems already from burst pipes from spring catchment and gravity flow systems;</li> <li>Sustainability for demonstration or school latrines = 2 due to unclear ownership and responsibility for on-going maintenance</li> </ul>
Coherence				X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Water, sanitation and hygiene project activities undertaken in all villages with wells and springs.</li> <li>School latrine construction and hygiene promotion not always both done in the 10 schools.</li> <li>ACF following MRRD / MPH guidance in methodology for HP and sanitation promotion, using the MRRD/MPH materials and guideline books; moving from subsidized demonstration latrines to CLTS; co-ordinating with others doing CLTS for learning and experience sharing</li> <li>Using MRRD designs for water points</li> </ul>
Coverage				X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>High coverage for water supply in short time frame = 5; positive for relationships insecure area; but only one water point per village</li> <li>Demonstration latrines constructed per village, but only some anecdotal reports from some beneficiaries of latrines being constructed as a result, no clear data or evidence on the result of the latrines leading to increased latrine construction = 3</li> <li>School latrine and HP only in 10 schools and some did not get both; inadequate evidence of completion of latrine construction = 2</li> </ul>
Relevance/ Appropriateness				X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The water projects – new and rehabilitated wells with the national standardized handpump, construction of spring catchments and piping, and BSF with training for O&amp;M are appropriate for the context = 5</li> <li>Efforts to involve people in constructing improved latrines as demonstrations also positive, but likely limited take up due to cost and limited commitment of the villagers to stopping open defecation = 3</li> <li>Hygiene promotion using various channels to reach people and involving local CHPs is relevant / appropriate although, the materials / methodologies should be revisited for consideration of possible improvements = 3</li> <li>School hygiene promotion and sanitation, several elements of HP in schools, not fully clear on time allocated and also on the completion of the school latrines or focus on the O&amp;M and hand-washing = 2</li> </ul>
Effectiveness			X			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Water projects = 4; In general the well projects seem to have gone well, with only minor challenges such as concrete platform being damaged during the winter and needing repair; spring catchment projects have faced problems with pipe bursts, pipes also dug too shallow for cold weather, and need revisiting; BSF well appreciated by the villagers and initial micro-biological results good</li> <li>Sanitation and hygiene promotion = 3; Community beneficiaries met know good practices for hygiene; not convinced many people will build a latrine or keep buying soap for hand-washing after they have used up the soap provided by ACF</li> </ul>
Efficiency				X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Considering that the programme only has a few months to implement the project effectively (4 months winter, 2 month higher security problems, 1 month Ramadan), the security challenges that are faced</li> </ul>

## 5.2 Conclusions and recommendations – implementation of the programme

### 5.1.1 Gender, vulnerability

#### Conclusions

- The team has made some good efforts to involve women as well as men in the projects at each stage, made possible mainly through the employment of hygiene promotion couples, partners of related men and women who travel and work together
- There are still however areas where the programme could improve in the area of involvement of women, such as ensuring equal access for male and female caretakers for training (finding a method of training the caretakers in groups in neighbouring villages for example), disaggregation of KAP data, integrating menstrual hygiene management into hygiene promotion or considering if there are income generating activities that could be supported as part of the programme
- The team has made a good effort to identify the extreme poor for the distribution of the winter kits (see below)

#### Recommendations

- Revisiting and strengthening gender aspects of the programmes - Mainstream gender disaggregated data collection, ensure that women have a voice and can participate in all assessments, evaluations, and activities undertaken, trainings, etc.
- Incorporate Menstrual Hygiene Management – Incorporate into community HP and school WASH, link with UNICEF & OXFAM-GB for experience sharing.
- Income generating opportunities - Consider supporting women's groups in soap making & menstrual hygiene pads production as a trial programme (note that BRAC has a trial activity for a women's group making sanitary materials using an imported machine, but they can also be made by hand)
- Ensure consideration of vulnerable groups – when facilitating discussions around CLTS and also when training Water Committees on issues around fund collection for the communal water points

### 5.1.2 Water supply

#### Conclusions

- The rehabilitation of the wells and construction of new ones, with installation of handpumps and the training of committees has been implemented appropriately and well appreciated by the community members met.
- The male and female members of the Water Committees could explain their roles and describe how they would solve a problem if they faced one with their water systems.
- The spring systems and gravity supplies have some technical weaknesses that need investigating and responding to – design / grade of pipes, location of break pressure tanks.
- It was not fully clear from the evaluation if the beneficiaries know how to clean their biosand filters if the flow rate becomes too slow.

#### Recommendations

- Technical assessment - There is a need to have a technical assessment undertaken of all of the gravity supply systems and all school latrine constructions. In addition the technical assessment should look at the quality of concrete construction for the water points, review the efforts made to improve the drainage from rehabilitated water points and also consider the recommendation for all water points to be fenced in the future. Remedy and problems found.
- Revisit the biosand villages - Undertake a practical exercise to revisit the process for cleaning the filter.
- To consider if it is possible to support a private sector supplier to sell the biosand filter – This should be for a sales profit in Ghor Province

### 5.1.3 Excreta disposal

#### Conclusions

- The ownership and responsibility for operation and maintenance was not clear for all of the workshop and demonstration latrines.
- There is no record of the number of latrines constructed since the project was implemented.
- The move to start CLTS in line with the Government policy (2010) is a positive step, but is likely to require a period of learning and experimentation; keeping linked in to the network for experience sharing will be very positive.
- Not certain on the structural integrity of the 'square' domed slabs and whether all of the concrete will remain in compression

#### Recommendations

- Ownership of latrines - Revisit all communities checking that the ownership and responsibility for all workshop and demonstration latrines is clear.
- Continue to engage with the co-ordination mechanism for those implementing CLTS in Afghanistan – And increase the number of follow up activities over a much longer period of time (several years).
- Consider training community masons to know how to construct a number of latrine options – Which can give options to the people building latrines after the community has been triggered.
- Where latrine options are supported – Ensure that the latrine designs offer a range of costs, consider the menstrual hygiene needs of women, that the doors / sheets forming a door can be locked and also that options are offered for people with limited mobility.
- Send the samples of the 'square' domed slabs to the University or Kabul or similar institution – for load bearing tests

### 5.1.4 Hygiene promotion

#### Conclusions

- The hygiene promotion uses multiple channels of activities in the mosques, in women's houses (in groups) and in schools.
- The HP team use the guidelines and most materials from the MoPH and MoRD. Not all materials are clear to their purpose, for example the river poster provided to the CHPs.
- It is not fully clear which of the many pictures are given to the CHPs or the variety of approaches for promotion of hygiene including those that are participatory.
- The hygiene promotion messages seem to focus mainly on the motivator of improving health.
- The data provided for the total number of people who received the hygiene kit which includes the leaflet is appropriate at the total population of the villages, but the data collated on hygiene promotion activities in the schools and communities is not real data as it simply documents a standard number of activities for every village or school noting that the full population has been reached

#### Recommendations

- Reflect on the current hygiene materials and methods use for hygiene promotion – considering the likelihood of effectiveness and also the education level of the hygiene promoters and the time available for hygiene promotion in each village.
- Undertake more in-depth learning of motivators for good hygiene behaviour - It would be positive to undertake a more detailed study of the motivators for behaviour change and to learn from those who do already practice good hygiene practice (the 'doers'), such as those who use a latrine and wash their hands with soap at critical times and then to integrate this information into the hygiene promotion activities that ACF undertakes.
- Consider new activities – Possible new activities which the hygiene promoters could support in the villagers to help the community members be more likely to improve and practice good hygiene behaviours such as: Demonstrating simple options for hand-washing facilities at the household level (tippy tap, leaky tin, tin with plug forced shut by weight of water etc); Varying the promotional methodologies to also include more variety, such as puppet shows, drama, songs, quizzes or drawing for children; Other possible activities such as soap making or making of local sanitary pads could also be promoted as a small income generating activity for the women and to help promote improved sanitary hygiene at the same time as ensuring

that women are fully engaged in the project.

- Integrating menstrual hygiene management into hygiene promotion activities - It would be positive to start to integrate good practice information on menstrual hygiene management for women and girls.
- Consider ways to improve the collation of hygiene promotion activity data which is more accurate - Or remove the number of activities per village from the spreadsheets as the figures are not accurate

#### 5.1.4 School water, sanitation and hygiene promotion

##### Conclusions

- The evidence for the completion of the school latrine construction was inadequate.
- It was not clear if the latrines constructed have hand-washing facilities installed and the responsibility for operation and maintenance is clear.
- It was not clear if the hygiene promotion activities in the schools are child friendly and varied in style to include participatory exercises, games etc.
- It appears that the teachers are not given any visual aids for sustaining the hygiene promotion over a longer period of time.
- The school hygiene promotion activities and the construction of latrines do not seem to be in the same schools and also may not be in the same villages as the water, sanitation and hygiene promotion community projects.

##### Recommendations

Revisit the school sanitation and hygiene promotion activities - The school WASH programme needs to be re-visited to strengthen the interventions in the following areas:

- Suitability of number of latrine cells to the number of pupils
- Ensuring that there are also separate latrines constructed for teachers
- Ensuring that the latrine blocks are well designed and are accessible and appropriate for all children, including smaller children, children with disabilities and adolescent girls
- Ensuring that there is a functional hand-washing facility with soap always present by the latrine
- Ensuring that there is a clear responsibility established for the operation and maintenance of the latrines and on who will pay for any repair, emptying or replacement of the latrines and other WASH infrastructure
- Provision of a water supply and adequate safe storage for drinking water for the children
- Ensuring that the teachers get adequate resource of teaching aids and approaches to keep supporting the children in their hygiene learning over time
- Ensuring that the methodologies supported are child friendly and varied for engaging the children of different ages (games, quizzes, drawing, singing, practical's etc)
- Including separate promotional sessions for older girls on menstrual hygiene management and also for teachers (both male and female) on how to ensure that the school is menstrual hygiene management friendly

#### 5.1.6 Winter kit

##### Conclusions

- The process for identification of the poorest families in the communities was detailed and impartial through its detailed scoring system, but the process which involved not informing people of why the assessment was taking place led to political challenges from leaders once they realised that they were not being entitled to the valuable winter kit provided to the most vulnerable families
- The winter kit was valued by the poorest families who received it and it was noted that it helped them to keep warm through the winter months

##### Recommendations

- Revise the methodology for identification of the winter kit - Reconsider the methodology for the identification of the poorest people and allocation of the winter kit to document the process and discuss it transparently with the community leaders from all communities together in one place for approval before the assessment exercise, and reduce the size of the kit to allow more of the poorest families to benefit from the distribution

### 5.3 Conclusions and recommendations – management

#### Conclusions

- The staff team in Ghor Province are working to full capacity to be able to implement the large number of projects in the limited six months available for project implementation
- The WASH Programme Manager is the only staff member in Ghor Province who speaks English and therefore has a very large workload for management and documentation of all activities as well as reporting.
- No international staff or national staff from Kabul have visited the project areas for some time due to insecurity, and hence monitoring has been limited.
- A significant effort has been made in documenting progress under the project, but the documentation has inconsistencies which indicates the need for the team from Kabul to check data and provide documentation and monitoring support to the team in Ghor
- It was not possible to correlate many of the names and villages of the beneficiaries met with the documents of the projects and members of the water committees, which highlighted the urgent need for standardising, coding and mapping project villages.
- The masons are currently the only ACF staff members in the Ghor programme who are laid off during the winter months without any salary.
- The lack of a WASH Co-ordinator at Kabul level is leading to gaps in support provided to the Ghor Province team, to checking documents and networking in Kabul. It is not possible for the current WASH Advisor to undertake all of the tasks of the WASH Co-ordinator as well as his other roles.
- Whilst the staff in Chaghcharan made every effort to make female visitors welcome, the office is clearly not designed well for female visitors or staff.

#### Recommendations

- Capacity building for the WASH PM - Identify a WASH training course (suggested between 3 weeks to 3 months) for the WASH PM as well as on report writing skills.
- Recruit a newly qualified school leaver – The school leaver should speak English to be trained as the deputy to the WASH Programme Manager in Ghor Province, and could take additional responsibility for monitoring / data to relieve the workload of the WASH PM.
- Payment to the masons over the winter months - The masons should be considered for salary or a part salary as retention over the winter months in line with all other staff.
- Reflect on the remote monitoring processes, document monitoring systems and revise as appropriate – Refer to **Section 4.2.3** for further details on a range of recommendations (such as documenting the existing monitoring systems, establishing peer review, regular reporting from villages on status of the facilities, standardising photographic evidence etc).
- Technical assessment required – By the Deputy WASH Advisor, for all of the spring and gravity projects and all of the school latrine construction projects, to survey, design and check implementation and quality of construction. Reflect also on the quality of concrete in the well projects and suggest improvements to mixes where appropriate.
- Mapping of all project villages - Link with an organisation or bring an expert in using Google Earth to assist is ACF to map all villages using GPS co-ordinates. If the project has a policy to a) keep using the first name given for the village (additional names could be added in brackets or as a sub-note); b) All villages are given a reference number that never changes for any of the ACF projects over time; c) And they are tracked on Google Earth as part of a mapping process, this should strengthen the accountability of the programme.
- Establishing contacts with experienced Afghan women for consultancies - Make links with other organisations who have experienced women who are prepared to travel to contract for monitoring, training, evaluations etc, for example from other NGOs, consultants etc, so that they could be contracted for specific activities including monitoring and evaluations.
- Consider linking up with the health sector for monitoring – To make use of the higher proportion of staff who are women and complementary sectoral areas of health and hygiene.
- Monitoring and gender post establishment - Consider a monitoring and gender advisor post (female) to provide support to the team in improving their methodologies, to support monitoring efforts, check documents / data, and follow up and ensure that gender issues doesn't get dropped when difficult, to ensure that women's voice and engagement is ensured at all stages of the projects as much as is possible within security constraints.
- Recruitment of WASH Co-ordinator post – To strengthen efforts to find a suitable candidate

for this post.

- Consider learning about working in partnership with organisations who have experience of this in the Afghanistan context – For example as OXFAM-GB.
- Assessment of all offices and accommodation from a gender perspective - Undertake an assessment from the woman staffs perspective (national and international) of the suitability of the field offices to women as well as man staff and visitors (considering locks on bedroom doors, separate toilets and sleeping sitting area, separate location to wash and dry clothes and burn menstrual hygiene materials, effective curtains on the windows, etc).

#### 5.4 Conclusions and recommendations – ACF internationally

##### Conclusions

- There is no specific requirement in the evaluation ToR for the evaluator to know about gender issues or a requirement for the evaluator to include both women and men beneficiaries in the evaluation or to disaggregate data on the project (where it is possible) and for who has been met as part of the evaluation.
- Menstrual hygiene management is not yet a standard element of hygiene promotion programmes in communities or schools for ACF projects.
- There is no fund allocation or requirement for ACF projects to continue to provide on-going monitoring and support over the duration of subsequent years programmes. This means that sustainability of water projects and the potential longer term impact of sanitation and hygiene behaviour change are limited by the short term nature of the funding.

##### Recommendations

- Involvement of women as well as men to be non-negotiable in all evaluations - All ToRs to include the requirement that the evaluator should be aware of gender and vulnerability related issues and that the evaluation must include speaking to women as well as men and some vulnerable people as well as where possible to disaggregate data. When it is difficult to speak with women as well as men because the evaluator is male then there should be a requirement to include a local female co-evaluator for at least part of the evaluation (which will probably also mean in the context of Afghanistan the costs of her Mahram). Budget should be included in the proposal .
- Integrating menstrual hygiene management into ACFs programmes - ACF should consider its approaches to menstrual hygiene management and how it can integrate it into its programmes and how it will build the confidence and capacity of its staff to effectively respond in this area.
- Providing on-going monitoring support to communities – ACF should be pushing donors to contribute a percentage of their humanitarian programme funds for using to continue to monitor and provide on-going occasional support to communities after the short term projects have been completed (no matter which donor), to help aid problem solving for sustainability and to encourage a longer term impact from sanitation and hygiene promotion interventions. If the donors will not fund this activity then, ACF should commit its own funds to this element.

#### 5.5 Conclusions and recommendations – ECHO and other donors

##### Conclusions

- Humanitarian donor funded projects still remain of short duration with no consideration for the longer term nature of many humanitarian contexts and the impacts that the short term funding has on the interventions sustainability and potential impacts.

##### Recommendations

- Humanitarian donors to commit to funding a percentage of new projects for organisations to provide on-going support to previous projects (from any donor) – This funding would be to revisit and provide on-going support for sustainability of water projects but also continued motivation for sanitation (CLTS) and for the hygiene promoters. It would not add to new beneficiary numbers (except if it results in more beneficiaries constructing latrines), but would contribute to the donors' resources having a greater impact over the longer term. The additional cost for mainly staff and logistics could be 5-10% of the new project costs.

# Annexes

## Annex I. Terms of Reference, Methodology

### Annex I.1 Terms of Reference

As the full Terms of Reference for the evaluation was 14 pages long only an extract of the ToR is included here. Refer to the full ToR for additional information.

#### AIM OF THE EVALUATION

##### Target User(s) of the Evaluation

<b>ACFIN</b>	N/A
<b>Implementing HQ</b>	WaSH department / Operations Department
<b>Field Level</b>	WaSH department
<b>Other</b>	MRRD, NGO's

##### Scope of the Evaluation

- (a) To draw learning's on the effectiveness of the ACF WASH strategy in Afghanistan for rural areas.
- (b) To assess the level of inclusion of women in the design and implementation of the project. To recommend ways in which women can be further involved in the design and implementation of the project.
- (c) To assess how effective is the capacity building strategy of ACF to ensure sustainability of the water points.
- (d) To assess the ACF approach and results in term of the most vulnerable beneficiaries' selection for the water point location and latrine's beneficiaries' selection.
- (e) To assess the ACF approach in term of beneficiaries and local authorities involvement in the design and implementation of the project.
- (f) To assess the ACF/MRRD approach and impact regarding the latrines "use" and the "promotional" impact on the community.
- (g) To assess the winter kit distribution process and impact.

##### Evaluation Criteria

ACF-IN subscribes to the Development Assistance Committee (DAC) criteria for evaluation: Impact, Sustainability, Coherence, Coverage, Relevance / Appropriateness, Effectiveness and Efficiency. ACF-IN also promotes systematic analysis of the monitoring system and cross cutting issues (gender, HIV/AIDS etc). All external evaluations are expected to use DAC criteria in data analysis and reporting. In particular, the evaluation must complete the following table and include it as part of the final report.

The evaluator will be expected to use the following table to rank the performance of the overall intervention using the DAC criteria. The table should be included either in the Executive Summary and/or the Main Body of the report.

Criteria	Rating (1 low, 5 high)					Rationale
	1	2	3	4	5	
Impact						
Sustainability						
Coherence						
Coverage						
Relevance/Appropriateness						
Effectiveness						
Efficiency						

### Best Practices

The evaluation is expected to provide one (1) key example of Best Practice from the project/programme. This example should relate to the technical area of intervention, either in terms of processes or systems, and should be potentially applicable to other contexts where ACFIN operates. This example of Best Practice should be presented in the Executive Summary and/or the Main Body of the report.

### Evaluation Outputs

The result of this evaluation should be presented in a written report and through several oral presentations:

- One on the mission (to Head of Mission and relevant technical staff)
- One at HQ (through teleconference to ACF HQ).

### Methodology

#### **Briefing**

Prior to the evaluation taking place, the evaluator is expected to attend a briefing at HQ level, and at field level with the Head of Mission and/or the relevant technical focal point. Briefings by telephone must be agreed in advance.

#### **Field activities**

Consultants are expected to collect an appropriate range of data. This includes (but not limited to):

- Direct information: Interviews with beneficiaries - Visit to project sites and to the facilities provided to the beneficiaries
- Indirect information: Interviews with local representatives; interviews with project staff expatriate and national staff); meeting with local authorities, groups of beneficiaries, humanitarian agencies, donor representatives and other stakeholders. For indirect data collection, standard and participatory evaluation methods are expected to be used (HH interviews and FGDs with beneficiaries, non-beneficiaries, key informants – health workers, teachers and leaders)
- Secondary information analysis: including analysis of project monitoring data or of any other relevant statistical data.

#### **Report**

The report shall follow the following format.

- Cover Page

- Table of Contents
- Executive Summary: must be a standalone summary, describing the programme, main findings of the evaluation, and conclusions and recommendations. This will be no more than 2 pages in length.
- Main Body: The main body of the report shall elaborate the points listed in the Executive Summary. It will include references to the methodology used for the evaluation and the context of the action. In particular, for each key conclusion there should be a corresponding recommendation. Recommendations should be as realistic, operational and pragmatic as possible; that is, they should take careful account of the circumstances currently prevailing in the context of the action, and of the resources available to implement it both locally and in the Commission. Annexes: Listed and correctly numbered. Format for the main body of the report is:
  - Background Information
  - Methodology
  - Findings & Discussions
  - Conclusions Recommendations
  - Annexes

The report should be submitted in the language specified in the ToR. The report should not be longer than 30 pages including annexes. The draft report should be submitted no later than 10 calendar days after departure from the field. The final report will be submitted no later than the end date of the consultancy contract. Annexes to the report will be accepted in the working language of the country and programme subject to the evaluation.

### ***Debriefing & Learning Workshop***

The evaluator should facilitate a learning workshop:

- To present the draft report and the findings of the evaluation to the Mission and other stakeholders.
- To gather feedback on the findings and build consensus on recommendations.
- To develop action-oriented workshop statements on lessons learned and proposed improvements for the future.

### ***Debriefing with ACF HQ***

The evaluator should provide a debriefing with the relevant ACF HQ on her/his draft report, and on the main findings, conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation. Relevant comments should be incorporated in the final report.

## **Annex I.2      Methodology**

The methodologies used for this evaluation included the following:

- i. Review of all project documents provided by ACF on the ECHO funded A122 project
- ii. Internet search on Afghanistan, Ghor Province, gender relations and involving women in development in Afghanistan
- iii. Phone discussions and face to face meetings with ACF staff from Paris, Kabul and Ghor Province and by email with an ex WASH Co-ordinator who had previously worked in Kabul
- iv. Collecting and analysing documents on project data and progress records, monitoring forms, budgets, hygiene promotion tools and a range of other documents relating to the implementation of the project (some analysed with the assistance of a translator between Dari and English)
- v. Meeting with male project beneficiaries (all of whom have some direct involvement in the project as Chairs of Water Committee, Caretakers, Community Hygiene Promoters, or recipients of the Winter Kit) in the Provincial town of Chaghcharan in the ACF office in 3 focus

groups, to discuss their experiences of and feelings about the project; the FGDs also included one participatory exercise using the 'Take Two Children' hygiene promotion card exercise to assess the level of hygiene understanding of the male beneficiaries

- vi. Discussion by SKYPE to speak with three female beneficiaries (who were also directly involved in the project as Community Hygiene Promoters and as a Caretaker), with the assistance of a male translator in Chaghcharan and a male office staff member in Du Layna
- vii. Meetings with Government officials (Provincial Government, MRRD in Ghor) and other NGOs (Voices of Women's Organisation in Ghor), and UNICEF in Kabul
- viii. Discussions by phone with other organisations (OXFAM-GB and Women for Women International in Kabul)

The methodologies available to the evaluator were limited by the fact that the evaluator was not able to leave Chaghcharan to visit the districts or the project villages and by the fact that women beneficiaries were unable to travel to Chaghcharan to meet the evaluator.

### Annex I.3 Schedule

Date	Activity	Days
Sun 14	PM – Afghanistan desk work	0.5
Mon 15		
Tues 16	PM – Afghanistan briefing from Paris	0.5
Weds 17		
Thurs 18	AM – Preparation for Afghanistan PM – Travel to Heathrow	1.0
Fri 19	AM & PM – Travel to Afghanistan via Dubai	1.0
Sat 20	AM – Arrival in Kabul PM – Desk work	1.0
Sun 21	AM – Briefing by ACF WASH Advisor and briefings / discussions with Security Advisor, HR Specialist, HP Specialist, Nutrition Advisor PM – Briefing ACF HoM & logistics	1.0
Mon 22	AM – Travel Kabul to Chaghcharan PM – Meet with ACF WASH PM and Head of Base	1.0
Tues 23	AM – Meet with Government officials MRRD; meet with ACF Social Mobiliser Team Leaders (2); test translators PM – Meet with first group of community representatives (7 men)	1.0
Weds 24	AM – Meet with second (5 men) and third group (4 men) of community representatives PM – Meet with Head of Ghor Office of Voice of Women's Organisation (1 man); meet with ACF hygiene promotion staff (1 woman, 2 men); meet with ACF construction staff and one social mobilisation team leader (7 men)	1.0
Thurs 25	AM – Meeting with community members (3 women) through SKYPE to the Du Layna Office with assistance of ACF staff translating and managing the SKYPE; Meet with WASH PM Ghor PM – Meet with WASH PM Ghor; Supported by translator to look at monitoring documents	1.0
Fri 26	AM & PM - Desk work	1.0
Sat 27	AM - Meet the Governor for Ghor Province PM – Desk work	1.0
Sun 28	AM & PM – Desk work	1.0
Mon 29	AM – Desk work PM - Fly back to Kabul; phone discussion with OXFAM	1.0
Tues 30	AM – Meeting with UNICEF PM - Rest	1.0
Weds 31	AM & PM – Desk work	1.0
Thurs 1	AM – Feedback & Desk work PM – Fly from Kabul to UK via Dubai	1.0
Fri 2	AM – Travel back to Leicester	1.0
Sat 3		

Sun 4		
Mon 5	Desk work	1.0
Tues 6	Desk work	1.0
Weds 7	AM & PM – Travel to and from Paris and debriefing	1.0
Thurs 8	Desk work	1.0
Fri 9	Desk work	1.0
Sat 10	Desk work	1.0
Sun 11	Desk work, submit first version of the report	0.75
Mon 12		
Weds 19 Oct	Revisions to the report	0.75
	Total days for the evaluation	24.5

Note – 1.0 UK days based on 8.0 hours of work; overseas days indicated as 1.0 day per day

## Annex II. Persons met

Note – When trying to cross-check the names of the beneficiaries versus the listings of Water Committee members and village names, it was only possible to identify half of the participants or their villages on the various lists provided. Those in italics could not be matched. Those in green have possible variations in names or village names as identified in brackets. Those in blue text were clearly identified.

Name	Male	Female	Position / Organisation	Village / Contact Details	Mode of Communication
<b>Community members</b> (all came from the District of Du Layna)					
Women's FGD – Thurs 25 Aug					
Gol Nasab		1	Community Hygiene Promoter, Water Committee	Gharak Abdul Qader	SKYPE to Du Layna office
Hazari		1	Community Hygiene Promoter, Water Committee	Gerd Holang	SKYPE to Du Layna office
Pari Gol (Joma Gul?)		1	Caretaker, Water Committee	Shahidan (Daray Shahidan Karez?)	SKYPE to Du Layna office
Men's FGD – Tues 23 Aug					
Saxod Gull	1		Received winter kit	Dara	Meet
Gull Mohammad (Lal Mohammad?)	1		Caretaker	Safra (Dewar Safid Sofra?)	Meet
Abdul Basir	1		Hygiene Promoter	Cuharak Ulia	Meet
Muhammad (Khan?)	1		Chairperson Water Committee, BSF village	Sexasang (Siyasang Mulha Mohammed?)	Meet
Men's FGD – Weds 24 Aug					
Rahmatullah	1		Cashier (Caretaker?)	Shah Jau Dalina (Sha Joy?)	Meet
Sayed Ali (Shir Ali?)	1		Head of Water Committee	Shah Jau Dalina (Sha Joy?)	Meet
Mohammed	1		Head of Water Committee	Askich (Jar Skechi?)	Meet
Ab. Rashid	1		Well Maintainer	Dara (Daray Sar Shidan?)	Meet
Baz Mohammad	1		Head of Water Committee	Korax Adam (Shor Ab Adham?)	Meet
Fazil Ahmad	1		Caretaker	Korax Adam (Shor Ab Adham?)	Meet
Nezamadin	1		Head of Water Committee	Khak Haji	Meet

Men's FGD – Weds 24 Aug					
Hamilullah (Abdullah?)	1		Cashier, BSF Village	Akktam (Akhtam?)	Meet
Abdul Rauf	1		Cashier, BSF Village	Cualabid (Gala Bed?)	Meet
Khaja Muhammad (Hjay Mulla Khaja or Haji Khaje Mohammed?)	1		Head of Water Committee	Bazarak Paiband (Bazarak Shurba? Or Tangy Shorba?)	Meet
Amir Muhammad	1		Teacher	Bedak Jalal	Meet
Abdul Wakil	1		Teacher	Tarbolagh	Meet
External stakeholders					
Ms Farida Faqiri		1	Programme Manager, Women for Women International, Kabul	0700-206 790, <a href="mailto:fafaqiri@yahoo.com">fafaqiri@yahoo.com</a>	Phone
Dr Sheeba Harma		1	Gender Manager, OXFAM-GB Afghanistan, Kabul	+93-0791-705 728, <a href="mailto:Sharma@oxfam.org.uk">Sharma@oxfam.org.uk</a>	Phone
Khair Mohammad	1		Head of Office, Ghor Province, Voice of Women's Organisation	0797-075 297, Also: Suraya Pakzad (f), Executive Director (Herat), <a href="mailto:vwo_suraya@hotmail.com">vwo_suraya@hotmail.com</a> ; <a href="mailto:vwo_afg@yahoo.com">vwo_afg@yahoo.com</a>	Meet
Zahida Stanekzai		1	WASH Officer, UNICEF, Afghanistan	+93(0)798507653 / +93(0)790507653 <a href="mailto:zstanekzai@unicef.org">zstanekzai@unicef.org</a>	Meet
Engineer Taj Mohammad 'Zolal'	1		Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development, Ghor Province	0799-360180, 0754-800072 <a href="mailto:Zolal.taj@gmail.com">Zolal.taj@gmail.com</a>	Meet
Noor Mohammad Yaqubi	1		Sectoral Service Director, Ghor Province (Deputy Governor)	<a href="mailto:yaqubinoor@gmail.com">yaqubinoor@gmail.com</a>	Meet
ACF					
Ghor Programme					
Ahmad Faiz Mohamad	1		Building Team Leader	Du Laynah	Meet
Ghulam Jan Mohammad	1		Building Team Leader	Du Laynah	Meet
Lal Mohamad Shir Jan	1		Hygiene Promotion Trainer	Du Laynah	Meet
Mirwais Mohammad	1		Social Mobilisation Team Leader	Du Laynah	Meet

Ramatullah	1		Social Mobilisation Team Leader	Du Laynah	Meet
Nazamadin Nooradin	1		Social Mobilisation Team Leader	Du Laynah	Meet
Amir Mohammad Mohammad Rasoc	1		Hygiene Promoter Field Officer	Du Laynah	Meet
Shokreyah Mohammad Khan		1	Hygiene Promoter Field Officer	Du Laynah	Meet
Lol Mohammed	1		Mason	Du Laynah	Meet
Slah Mohammad	1		Mason	Du Laynah	Meet
Mohammad Abdul Aziz	1		Mason	Du Laynah	Meet
Moh-Taher-Rasoli	1		WASH Programme Manager, Ghor Province	+88-216-5060 3890; 0796-418 659 <a href="mailto:Wash-ghor@acf.missions-acf.org">Wash-ghor@acf.missions-acf.org</a>	Meet
Abdull Wakil Hajy Abdul Sami	1		Head of Base	0797-595 405 <a href="mailto:Log-ghor@acf.missions-acf.org">Log-ghor@acf.missions-acf.org</a>	Meet
Ghisadin Nor Uddin			Base administrator, Chaghcharan		
Abdul Qioum Moh Omer	1		Base Administrator, Du Layna		Assisted with technology for women's SKYPE call
Bashir Ahmad	1		Food Security Program Manager		Assisted with translation for women's SKYPE call
Kabul					
Nicolas Kachrillo	1		WASH Advisor, Kabul	+ 93 – 793 923 568 <a href="mailto:washadvisor@af.missions-acf.org">washadvisor@af.missions-acf.org</a>	Meet
Arnaud Phipps	1		Head of Mission, Afghanistan	+93-799566128, <a href="mailto:hom@af.missions-acf.org">hom@af.missions-acf.org</a>	Meet
Masoomu Hamkat		1	Deputy Programme Manager, Kabul Project (and in charge of hygiene promotion), Kabul	<a href="mailto:Hpwash-kabul@af.missions-acf.org">Hpwash-kabul@af.missions-acf.org</a>	Meet
Laily Samadi		1	Human Resources Manager	+93-799 320 270 <a href="mailto:hrm@af.missions-acf.org">hrm@af.missions-acf.org</a>	Meet
Brigitte Tonon		1	Nutrition Co-ordinator, Kabul		Meet
Paris, UK, ex-staff					

Ben Allen	1		Evaluations, Learning & Accountability Officer	+44 (0) 20 8853 7564; +44 (0) 7748 657 625, <a href="mailto:b.allen@aahuk.org">b.allen@aahuk.org</a>	Email
Nicolas Villemont	1		WASH Advisor, Pool Desk (Haiti, Zimbabwe, Afghanistan)	+33 (0)1 43 35 86 26, <a href="mailto:nvillemintot@actioncontrelafaim.org">nvillemintot@actioncontrelafaim.org</a>	Phone
Isabelle Moussard Carlsen		1	Head of Pool Desk (Haiti, Zimbabwe, Afghanistan)	<a href="mailto:imoussardcarlsen@actioncontrelafaim.org">imoussardcarlsen@actioncontrelafaim.org</a>	Phone
Vincent Gengler	1		Previous WASH Co-ordinator, Afghanistan	<a href="mailto:v.gengler@gmail.com">v.gengler@gmail.com</a>	Email
Total					

## Annex III. Background information

### Annex III.1 ACF Strategy, WASH Policy & Gender Policy

#### ACF Strategy and WASH Policy

##### **ACF International Strategy for 2010-2015**

Aims:

- Increase impact on acute under-nutrition, curatively and preventatively, especially in young children
- Respond to and prevent humanitarian crises, address vulnerability and reinforce longer term resilience to food, water and nutritional crises
- Develop partnerships with local, national and international stakeholders to increase the number of people we assist and promote sustainably
- Build our capacity to ensure an effective and efficient response to humanitarian crises
- Maximise our pre-eminence as an advocate and a reference source on hunger and under-nutrition

##### **ACF WASH Policy, 2011**

Summary of overarching principals:

- Humanitarian principals
- Professionalism and quality assurance
- Grassroots approach, community empowerment and accountability
- Rights-based approach
- The first 'do no harm' and precautionary principal

Summary of operational principals:

- **Achieving a measurable impact** – Morbidity data, integrated approach, full coverage
- **Coherence** – Co-ordination, standardisation, standards
- **Coverage** – Vulnerability of beneficiaries, number, geographical scope
- **Relevance and appropriateness** – Participatory approach, evidence based, public health risk analysis, targeting, contribution of communities, feasibility (technical, cultural, socio-economic, environmental)
- **Sustainability** – Feasibility, integrated resources management, value chain approach, appropriation and ownership, building capacities, disengagement, replication
- **Effectiveness** – Timely, contingency plans, co-ordination, logical framework analysis, appropriate project time-frame, documented monitoring
- **Efficiency** – Link between input and outputs, administrative and managerial processes, follow-up, logistics, financial processes, low cost technologies, purchasing locally, community contributions, smart funding mechanisms income generating activities

#### ACF Gender Policy

ACF has a document (2004) entitled 'Integrating Gender Mainstreaming in AAH-ACF-ACH'. It notes that structural inequalities and unequal relationships of power mean that women and men do not enjoy the same socio-economic and political rights and that caring for the specific needs, capacities and special risks of men and women is a necessary condition for quality, effective and sustainable aid.

It notes that integrating gender mainstream does not mean incorporating women to AAH-ACF-ACH programs, but also making all the actions needed to ensure that all the programs, projects and strategies reflect and integrate the needs, vulnerabilities, capacities of both men and women, thus contributing to achieve gender equity.

The document notes that gender approaches must be flexible and defined for different contexts, but also that gender mainstreaming will be introduced in the training of teams and communities and that gender mainstreaming must be considered during all processes from the identification of needs, project formulation to monitoring and evaluation, to take into account the interests and needs of men and women and the impact on both populations of every action.

### Annex III.3 Target area – Geography, demography, culture, politics, security

Afghanistan is ranked 155 out of 169 countries on the Human Development Index<sup>28</sup>. It has a total population of 29.1 million (2010) and an estimated annual growth rate of 3.2% (2010-2015). Life expectancy in Afghanistan was estimated at 47 for male and 45 for female in 2004<sup>29</sup>. GDP per capita for 2003 was USD 190<sup>30</sup>. U5 mortality (2008) was 257 / 1,000 live births.

Literacy in Afghanistan is estimated at 24% of the total population, with women who are literate estimated at 13% and men at 32%. In Ghor literacy is estimated at 15%, with women at 3% and men at 25%<sup>31</sup>. Ministry of Education Data<sup>32</sup> indicates an overall number of girls as a percentage of boys in education as 52% (56% for primary and 32% for secondary). In Ghor Province these figures change to 29% overall (31% at primary and 7% at secondary).

75% of the land area of the district (total land area of the districts being approximately 36,479 square km) is mountainous with scattered remote communities which are often cut off in winter and are drought-prone in the summer. The population estimate (2005-6) was 5,600 in urban areas and 580,300 in rural areas with 58% of the population being of Tajik ethnic origin, 39% being Hazara, 3% being Pashtun and <1% being Uzbek<sup>33</sup>.

Afghanistan has faced multiple periods of insecurity over the past decades from the period of Soviet invasion and the Afghan-Soviet conflict, the Mujahedeen government and civil war, the Taliban rule, and the post Taliban period with conflict between the Armed Opposition Group (AOGs) and the transitional administration of Hamid Karzai and international forces.

Ghor Province currently faces an increasing level of insecurity through an increase in activity of AOGs, making travel difficult for both international and national staff.

### Annex III.4 Gender and vulnerable groups

#### **The situation of women in Afghanistan**

A study on national reconstruction and poverty reduction looking into the role of women in Afghanistan's future (2005)<sup>34</sup> notes that gender discrimination in Afghanistan is pervasive and provides an overview of the situation of women in Afghanistan, some key points from which are noted below.

Gender gaps are widespread in health, education, access to and control over resources, economic opportunities and power and political voice. There has been a significant increase in school enrolment during the last few years, with one third of enrolled students being girls, but this still hides disparities by region with only 15% of total enrolment being girls in the 9 provinces of the south and east. Schools are faced with high drop-out rates which in 1999 were reported as 74% for girls in grades 1-5 compared to 56% for boys.

<sup>28</sup> UNDP Human Development Report, 2010

<sup>29</sup> UNDP National Human Development Report for Afghanistan, 2007

<sup>30</sup> UNDP National Human Development Report for Afghanistan, 2004

<sup>31</sup> National Risk and Vulnerability Assessment Survey, 2005 in the UNDP Human Development Report for Afghanistan, 2007.

<sup>32</sup> MoE data, 2005, in the UNDP Human Development Report for Afghanistan, 2007

<sup>33</sup> Program for Culture and Conflict Studies (2008) Information on Ghor Province, [www.nps.edu/programs/ccs](http://www.nps.edu/programs/ccs)

<sup>34</sup> The World Bank (2005) 'Afghanistan; National Reconstruction and Poverty Reduction – The role of women in Afghanistan's future'

Various obstacles to ensuring that there is 100% enrolment of which 50% are girls, which include: lack of school facilities and in particular girls' schools in rural areas; lack of female teachers, out-dated curricula including the portrayal of gender roles; schools lacking water supply and toilet facilities, and the custom of marrying off girls at a young age also poses a significant barrier to girls being able to complete their education. Targeting of girls schools such as bombing or burning down schools and campaigning against female education also poses security challenges for girls to be able to continue their education, the cost of school uniforms and stationary, the loss of girls domestic labour if the girl is in school, as well as parent's negative attitudes to girls education, particularly from illiterate fathers'.

Women play an extremely important role in all dimensions of agricultural production, but most of women's contributions are not monetized. Women's involvement in the formal sector was severely disrupted during the rule of the Taliban when educated women were not allowed to work for 7 years except in the medical profession. Currently close to one-third of all teachers are female, while an estimated 40% health facilities lack a female staff member, a serious constraint to delivering basic health services to women. Women's wage rates are normally half that of men's or less. Women's role and contributions to the economy are often invisible and undervalued.

Women often lack ownership, control and access to productive assets such as land, equipment and materials, and their legal right to inheritance is usually bypassed.

'In Afghanistan, the patrilineal family with its notions of honor and shame defines gender relations in terms of complementarities rather than equality. Since women are the prime bearers of the family honor, their seclusion and chastity reflect the honor of the extended family, which controls (and limits) their relations with the outside world. The purdah norms to which all women must subscribe in varying degrees, on the other hand also require the man to protect and provide for the women in the family – they are his *nang* and *namus* (honor and reputation) and he is responsible for their well-being and for providing for them, if he wants to be counted as a man of honor'.

'As citizens, Afghan women face constitutional equality but legal inequality. Furthermore, there are great discrepancies between customary law, civil law and Islamic Law - as well as the informal justice system, which tends to grant women even less rights. Years of conflict and violence have further eroded the protection of women's (limited) rights, and a culture of impunity reigns as far as violence is concerned, including violence against women inside and outside the household. The present deteriorating security situation in many parts of the country constitutes the most serious obstacle to promoting rule of law, respect for human rights and introduction of legal reform, which would benefit women more than any other group in society'.

'The definition of gender roles is so central to Afghan society and culture that any perceived or planned changes require consultations not only with the household but also with the larger community'<sup>35</sup>.

In 2004, Afghanistan adopted its new constitution, establishing the country as an Islamic Republic, and including the following element in the constitution '*The citizens of Afghanistan – whether man or woman – have equal rights and duties before the law*' and 50% of the *Meshrano Jirga* that the President appoints must be women'<sup>36</sup>. A Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) was formed to keep attention on women's rights.

**Table 8 - Ministry of Women's Affairs, 1383-7 Strategic Objectives for Women's Advancement**

<b>Capacities</b>	Second chance, accelerated learning for women and youth
<b>Opportunities</b>	Skills building for sustainable income and poverty reduction, with rural focus
<b>Empowerment</b>	Promoting women in decision-making in governance structures
<b>Security</b>	Promoting legal and physical protection for women, including from exploitation
<b>Capacity building</b>	For gender analysis, policy development and budgeting in key Ministries

<sup>35</sup> The World Bank (2005) 'Afghanistan; National Reconstruction and Poverty Reduction – The role of women in Afghanistan's future'

<sup>36</sup> Qazi, A (downloaded Aug 2011) 'The Plight of Afghan Woman; Afghan Women's History', <http://www.afghan-web.com/afghanwomenhistory.html>



**Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development,  
Afghanistan National Rural Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) Policy, 2010**

Policy goal

Improvement in the quality of life of people through their improved access to safe, convenient, sustainable water and sanitation services, and increased adoption of hygienic practices at the personal, household and community levels, resulting in (i) reduced morbidity and mortality rates (particularly under-five child mortality) and (ii) enhanced people's productivity and well-being.

Policy objectives:

- Improve access of the rural population to 25 litres per capita per day (LPCD) from 27% to 50% in 2014, and 70% to 100% in 2016 and 2020 respectively and improve potable quality of drinking water (WHO standards).
- Make all villages / rural communities in the country 100% ODF free and fully sanitised by 2020; and 50% and 70% by 2014 and 2016 respectively by empowering communities to: improve existing traditional latrines to become safe, hygienic and ensure user privacy; make new latrines as models of safe sanitation in households, schools and clinics; undertake disposal of solid wastes.
- Provide hygiene education with appropriate follow-up activities in schools, households and communities for sustained behaviour change and adoption of safe hygiene practices.

Policy principals:

- Ensuring community participation in decision-making for women and men in planning, design and service delivery, ensuring ownership and sustainability at the community level.
- Partial capital cost sharing and 100% operation and maintenance responsibility by the community for all water facilities.
- Gender mainstreaming through women's active involvement, particularly in *Shuras* and in CDC decision-making to ensure social equity and justice.
- Protecting the human rights (safety, security, privacy and dignity) of people, particularly women, children, returnees, IDPs, and physically and mentally challenged.
- Protecting the environment by conserving water sources, adapting to climatic changes through the preservation and improvement of catchment areas, with a focus on recharging ground water.

Selection of WASH norms and policy approaches:

- Availability of 25 LPCD
- Maximum of 20 households to be covered by one water point
- Safe access to water within 250 metres of residence and not take up more than 60 minutes per round trip
- MRRD/RuWATSIP engineers, facilitating partners, support organisations and community facilitators need to help the rural communities innovate their own latrine designs, keeping in view the local conditions, community requirements (particularly the most vulnerable groups such as the elderly and disabled) and resources.
- There will be no upfront hardware subsidy for individual households to construct latrines / toilets. In case it is considered necessary, individual subsidies can be replaced by post achievement awards / incentives for rural communities and villages achieving ODF and fully sanitised status.
- All schools and health clinics have proper hand-washing facilities with water and soap available at all times. Gender specific requirements in ensuring safe sanitation and hygiene practices, especially sanitary requirements of girls and women must be actively considered. Women and girls trained in the practice of safe use and disposal of sanitary materials.
- Women and girls are undeniably the primary stakeholders in the provision of water and sanitation services at the household and community level. Consequently, it will be critical to engage and

empower women by strengthening the institution of women *Shuras* and women's groups by making their role central in project planning and management at village level. Capacity building of women and girls in leadership and community mobilisation, along with relevant technological aspects will be promoted. The cultural and social barriers to women's equitable role in water, sanitation and hygiene activities will be identified and the gender gap minimised through discussion with men and women.

- The MoPH will be the major partner for putting in place water quality monitoring systems and water treatment facilities to help promote the use of safe water.
- The Management Information System will include gender reporting so that partners share the gender component of their programmes, in addition to making gender segregated data available.

### Annex III.5 History of ACF in Afghanistan and the Ghor Province programme

ACF worked initially in the refugee camps in Quetta, Pakistan and started working in Afghanistan in 1995 and since this time except for a short period has had projects in Afghanistan. In 2007, ACF implemented projects in Kabul as well as in Dai Kundi and Ghor Provinces. Since 2009, the focus of ACFs intervention in Afghanistan has been to respond to the acute needs of vulnerable populations in a defined geographical area.

#### ACF Strategic Priorities in Afghanistan

- **Strengthening livelihoods, increasing resilience and prevention of malnutrition for the most vulnerable households:**
  - Reducing food insecurity
  - Prevention of malnutrition
  - Continuous monitoring of the malnutrition situation/rates in ACF's area of intervention
- **Ensure access to potable water and sanitation for the marginalised population in both rural and urban areas:**
  - Addressing basic water and sanitation needs
- **Effective and efficient response to emergencies:**
  - Build ACF capacities to respond effectively and efficiently to emergencies in operational areas
  - Explore ways to respond to emergencies in areas where no other actors are present
- **To find and strengthen new ways of working:**
  - Develop a database on local partners and assess their strengths;
  - Initiating partnerships based on ideological compatibility to set up mutual support on capacity development;
  - Develop mechanisms for peer evaluations and capacity support.

ACF has been working in Afghanistan since 1995 and in Ghor Province since 2007. It started implementing projects in the two districts of Du Layna and Shahrak in 2009 with the initial ECHO funded project, ECHO/AS/BUD/2009/01019 from July 2009 - June 2010.

Annex IV. Photographic evidence of the project activities

**Landscape and logistics in Ghor Province**

Fig 2 – Landscape and logistics in Ghor Province



**Winter kit distribution**



Fig 3 – Preparation of the winter kit



Fig 4 – Distribution process for the winter kit



Fig 5 – Beneficiaries of the winter kit



Fig 6 – Beneficiary of the winter kit



Fig 7 – Beneficiary of the winter kit and the voucher system



Fig 8 – Discussing the content of the winter kits with beneficiaries

**Water projects**



Fig 9 – Measuring the gravel for a biosand filter



Fig 10 – Levelling the biosand filter during installation



Fig 11 – Well under construction



Fig 12 – Well rings at the manufacturing yard



Fig 13 – A completed well – one of the few with a fence constructed around the water point



Fig 14 – Completed new well with drainage curtain



Fig 15 – Spring before protection



Fig 16 – Pipeline dug for gravity supply

**Latrine construction training and demonstration latrines**



Fig 17 – Training for the round domed slab



Fig 18 – Training on constructing the modified 'square' domed slab



Fig 19 – Demonstration latrine with internal wall and plastic sheet door



Fig 20 – Demonstration latrine (hand-washing facility and pipe for urine not visible)

**Hygiene promotion activities in schools**

Fig 21 – Photos of hygiene promotion activities in schools



## Annex V. Activities to be completed vs planned activities

**Table 9 - Activities reported to be completed vs planned activities**

Results (LFA)	Activity (LFA)	Goal	Implementation Steps	Total reported as completed	Evidence of activities having been undertaken / comments from evaluator	Number of beneficiaries reported by the project
<b>Result 1:</b> 3220 families in the districts of Du Layna and Sharak have sustainable access to safe drinking water and water for other domestic use.	60 new public water points are constructed (one water point per 25 families "MRRD guideline"). They are used, operated and maintained by communities.	60	Assessment done	60	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>Photographs including signboards next to water points and dates scored into concrete of platforms of wells</li> <li>Assessment summary of all villages before selection</li> <li>Spreadsheets of completed work</li> <li>Names of water committee members</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The project has implemented one well per community, and not following the guideline of a maximum of families per water point</li> <li>The signed MoUs would also provide evidence but the evaluator did not request to see these</li> </ul>	9,000 (at 25 families / water point)
			Number of villages selected			
			Wells location selected			
			Tools distributed (Number of villages)			
			Digging start (Number of well)			
			Water reached (Number of well)			
			Digging finished (Number of well)			
			Ring dispatched (Number of well)			
			Apron installed (Number)			
			Hand pump installed			
			Well disinfected			
			Water analyzed (Number of wells)			
			Monitoring sheet totally filled			
Hand over signed						
40 broken hand pumps are repaired and operational, used and maintained by communities, (one water point per 25 families "MRRD guideline").	40	40	Assessment done	40	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>Photographs of damaged wells before rehabilitation</li> <li>Spreadsheets of completed work</li> <li>Assessment summary of all villages before selection</li> <li>Names of water committee members</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not clear from the photographs which wells have been rehabilitated</li> <li>The project has implemented one well per community, and not following the guideline of a maximum no of families per water point</li> <li>The signed MoUs would also provide evidence but the evaluator did not request to see these</li> </ul>	6,000 (at 25 families / water point)
			Number of Villages selected			
			Wells selected			
			Well /apron repaired			
			Hand pump repaired			
			Well disinfected			
			Water analyzed (Number of wells)			
			Monitoring sheet totally filled			
			Hand over signed			
6 kareze are protected and	6	6	Assessment done	6	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> </ul>	3,600
			Number of Villages selected			

	improved by implementing of gravity fed system (one for 100 families). They are used and maintained by the community.		Kareze selected Kareze cleaned Kareze in construction Kareze finished  Hand over signed		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Photographs</li> <li>Spreadsheets of completed work</li> <li>Names of water committee members</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The structures constructed are all spring catchments with gravity supply and not karezes</li> <li>There are technical problems with the gravity supply systems – see the section on effectiveness below</li> <li>The signed MoUs would also provide evidence but the evaluator did not request to see these</li> </ul>	(at 100 families per kareze)
	120 Biosand filters are distributed (1 per family). They are used properly and maintained by the beneficiaries.	120	Assessment done Number of Villages selected Number of family selected Focal person identified 2 person trained per villages Biosand filter distributed Water analyzed Monitoring done Hand over signed	120	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>Photographs</li> <li>Spreadsheet of owners of the biosand filters</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There also seem to be Water Committees formed in the biosand villages but they seem to be of different memberships</li> <li>Two different lists of the villages where the biosand filters were supported indicate different numbers of villages – one 19 and one 21 villages</li> </ul>	720 (at 1 filter / family)
	One water committee is established and trained per targeted villages.	106	Committee members selected Initial training conducted MOU with water committee signed Committee kit distributed  Water committee considered as trained	106	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>Photographs</li> <li>Listings of members of the water committees for the well and spring projects</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The members of the Water Committee were able to describe some of their responsibilities when the pump breaks down</li> <li>The evaluator was unable to match a proportion of the names and villages of the beneficiaries met to the list of members of the Water Committees provided</li> </ul>	
	Caretakers (2 for each new and repaired water point) are trained and given tools	212	Caretakers identified Caretakers trained at hand pump installation Caretakers trained 3 days Caretakers kit distributed	100	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments, including having received a set of spares</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Only 100 caretakers were trained because only the men were trained, the women were not trained in the 3 day training noted to be because they could not travel</li> </ul>	
	Mechanics are trained (1 for every 10 new and repaired water	10	Mechanic identified Mechanic trained at hand pump installation Mechanic trained 3 days	10	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No mechanics were met but the beneficiaries explained</li> </ul>	

	points) and given spare part tools		Mechanic kit distributed		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>how they had already used their services</li> <li>The mechanics tools were purchased from a different budget line to the one indicated in the summary sheet of the expenditure (which indicated no expenditure)</li> </ul>	
<b>Result 2:</b> 544 families and 10 schools in the districts of Du Layna and Sharak have community-based safer disposal of excreta, reducing the spread of potential diseases, through latrine construction.	358 demonstration latrines have been constructed, used and maintained, (3 for each new and rehabilitated water point as of MRRD standard, 2 per villages benefiting from the Bio-sand filters)	<b>358</b>	Slabs constructed	<b>358</b>	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>A few photographs of latrines, but it wasn't clear to the evaluator which ones were demonstration latrines from the Project except for one example discussed with the Programme Manager</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The bio-sand villages had 'square' domed slabs and the other villages had standard square slabs with reinforcement</li> <li>Ownership and who will operate and maintain the demonstration latrines was not clear from the discussions with the beneficiaries</li> </ul>	2,508 (418 x 6 per family)
			Slabs distributed			
			Latrines in construction			
			Latrines complete			
			Number of beneficiaries using the latrines			
	Handover signed					
	60 latrines shared in 10 schools	<b>60</b>	Latrines in construction	<b>60</b>	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>None seen – no photographs available</li> <li>Information from teachers met did not match with information on documents provided, one teacher reported the latrine was not completed</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The ACF technical team in Kabul is recommended to visit all of the school latrines to check completion and quality of construction and O&amp;M arrangements</li> </ul>	
	Latrines complete					
	Number of beneficiaries using the latrines					
	Handover signed					
	544 latrines kit are distributed	<b>544</b>	Latrine kits distributed	<b>544</b>	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Photographs of the distribution</li> </ul>	
	106 workshop slabs are set up (one for each targeted water point and 106 latrines are duplicated)	<b>106</b>	Slabs constructed	<b>106</b>	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>Photographs of some of the trainings constructing slabs (all male participants)</li> <li>Photographs of a few latrines, but it wasn't clear to the evaluator which latrines were constructed under the programme or were 'workshop latrines'</li> </ul> <b>Comments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>'Workshop latrines' are those constructed as part of a workshop training and remaining as demonstration latrines after the workshop</li> </ul>	636
	Slabs distributed					
	Latrines in construction					
	Latrines completed					
	Number of beneficiaries using the latrines					
	20 workshop slabs are set up (per villages benefiting of the Biosand filters)	<b>20</b>	Slabs constructed	<b>20</b>	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>Photographs of some of the trainings constructing slabs (all male participants)</li> <li>Photographs of a few latrines, but it wasn't clear to the</li> </ul>	
	Slabs distributed					
	Latrines in construction					
	Latrines completed					

			Number of beneficiaries using the latrines		evaluator which latrines were constructed under the programme or were 'workshop latrines'	
	80 latrines are duplicated in the 20 villages benefitting of the biosand filters	80	Latrines kit distributed Slabs constructed Latrines in construction Latrines completed Number of beneficiaries using the latrines	80	<b>Evidence:</b> • Beneficiary comments, but no way to check if 80 latrines have been constructed during the training <b>Comments:</b> • 'Workshop latrines' are those constructed as part of a workshop training and remaining as demonstration latrines after the workshop	480
<b>Result 3:</b> 3220 families in the districts of Du Layna and Sharak benefitting from the 106 public water points (60 new, 40 repair water points and from the 6 protected kareze) will have access to hygiene knowledge and are enabled to improve hygiene behaviours.	100% of the 3220 families receive 3 rounds of hygiene promotion messages.	3220	CHP round 1 (no of participant) CHP round 2 (no of participant) CHP round 3 (no of participant) ACF home visit round 1 (no of families) ACF home visit round 2 (no of families) ACF home visit round 3 (no of families) ACF public sessions (No of sessions)	3220	<b>Evidence:</b> • Beneficiary comments <b>Comments:</b> • This is an assumed number of people reached, which is equal to the total number of families in the villages	19,320
	100% of the CHP will received hygiene kits	212	CHP hygiene kits distributed	212	<b>Evidence:</b> • Not investigated as part of evaluation	
	3220 hygiene kits are distributed to targeted families	3220	Family hygiene kit distribution	3220	<b>Evidence:</b> • Not investigated as part of evaluation, but women noted that they had been given soap from ACF	Same as families included in HP above
	2800 students from DL and SH school are targeted for hygiene education during workshops	2800	School identified School selected Teacher trained (no teacher trained) Hygiene clubs established and trained Student receiving a minimum of 3 sessions (ACF or Teacher or Hygiene Club)	2800	<b>Evidence:</b> • Photographs • Teacher comments <b>Comment:</b> • No photographic evidence of hygiene club establishment or teacher training	School children counted in water project beneficiaries
	2800 hygiene kits are distributed to school students during 10 workshops	2800	hygiene kits distributed Follow up started	2800	<b>Evidence:</b> • Photographs of the notebook and pen distribution	

<b>Result 4:</b> 500 remote families in the districts of Du Layna and Shahrak will be supported with non food items and good hygiene practices messages to protect them from the extreme condition on winter time.	500 essential winter kits will be distributed to the most vulnerable people. (The kit is following the Wash cluster, UNHCR and DDP standard).	650	Assessment done	650	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Photographs of some of the beneficiaries and some of the distributions</li> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> <li>Reports of problems of jealousy following the distribution from other members of the community</li> </ul>	3,000 (original number) + 150 x 6 (additional kits provided) = 3,900
			Village selection			
			Family targeted			
			distribution point identified			
			Kit distributed			
	Number of beneficiaries reached					
	100% of the 500 families receive 1 round of hygiene promotion and on the kit using messages	650	Household HP session (No of families)	650	<b>Evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Photographs of some of the beneficiaries and some of the distributions</li> <li>Beneficiary comments</li> </ul>	Included above
			Public HP (No of sessions)			
			No of participant			

**Table 10 - Recommended framework for remote monitoring for discussion and further development<sup>40</sup>**

Methodology	Done at present?	Useful information gathered	Comments
<b>Internal ACF monitoring</b>			
Quarterly, monthly, daily planning and progress updates	Yes	Useful to measure progress vs planned activities plus to discuss any challenges	
Individual staff activity record sheets	Yes	The activity undertaken, date of visit, who was met in the community, vehicle used	Could be a useful tool for evidence of programme implementation but only if keep in good order and monitored
Logistics records / security authorisations	Yes	Can be used for triangulating with the activity records sheets	
Databases of villages assessed	Yes <sup>41</sup>		Should include population and household data, as well as ethnicity breakdown.
Databases of selected villages with justification	Yes	Justification for the village selections	The process of deciding on one village or another should be clearly documented with justification for decisions. Can be useful for both solving disputes with communities or authorities and also as evidence for the donor of the non-partisan selection of the project villages.
Names and members of the Water Committees, community leaders, school teachers	Yes – WC members for the well projects		It would be useful to record all key stakeholders in the projects, not only for the well projects, but also the Water Committees for the BSF villages and the contacts for the school projects
Minutes of Water Committee meetings	Not known	If the communities have a standard process of record keeping for discussions or decisions at the Water Quality meetings these can also be used as a	But time would be needed to look into these in selected communities

<sup>40</sup> Includes existing methodologies, ideas for strengthening the remote monitoring

<sup>41</sup> But took some time to get the full listing of villages assessed from the team as there seem to be several lists; plus it was also difficult to work out from the lists how the selections had been made; hence improving the documentation of this process would be useful

		reference to identify progress	
GPS data, unique reference codes given to all villages and agreed spelling of name of village at start of project	Some	Useful to be able to accurately track work in each village and to cross check versus other databases; would provide a data trail for audit purposes	It proved difficult to cross-reference names of villages and even names of Water Committee members with the records (only half were possible), which was put down to the different spellings of the names and villages during translation
Mapping of GPS data and unique village codes on Google Earth	No	Useful for discussion and clarity on dispersal of projects and remaining needs in the districts	
Water quality test results	Yes	Undertaken for the biosand filters after installation and for the water points	
Visits by the WASH PM	Yes	Identify progress, successes, challenges, technical quality of the projects, community opinions on the projects	
Visits by the technical WASH team in Kabul (male and female staff)	Yes but not often	Identify progress, successes, challenges, technical quality of the projects, community opinions on the projects  Occasional visits by female staff members who can travel to some villages would also be positive to ensure the female beneficiaries can also comment on the projects and progress	More regular Visits to the Provincial Centre and where possible to the villages to see projects by the WASH team in Kabul would be helpful for supporting the team and monitoring the projects  If the visits also coincide with activities such as training when the community members are in the provincial centre or district centre this can also give the Kabul based staff an opportunity to meet the community members from a range of villages at the same time and ask their opinions on how the projects are going
<b>Community members monitoring</b>			
Signing of the MOU and the completion / handover documents for community water projects	Yes (to be confirmed)	The MoU indicates the villages commitment to the project and their agreement in their responsibilities	
Regular update forms from the CHPs at village level	Yes	Evidence on the activities of the Community Hygiene Promoters after the HP Couples have left the village	These are collected by the HP Trainer of ACF in Ghor. For these to be most useful, they would need to be collated and kept in an organised manner for evidence of progress.
Regular update forms from the WCs	No	These could be designed to be collected on a quarterly basis to include current status from the WC on the water project	If a regular quarterly monitoring visit was done by the ACF team and a form written and signed by the community member, including information on the water project as well as status of the

		and also for the latrine status including any problems faced and solutions found	demonstration latrines as well as a record of any new latrines constructed, this would be valuable information for monitoring sustainability, problems and solutions and also continued progress for the sanitation elements
Photographic evidence using a disposable camera	No	This could give the communities perspective on the project as well as evidence of the work completed	Would need to confirm that disposable cameras are available in Afghanistan and that they can be processed
<b>External monitoring</b>			
Peer monitoring by other NGOs working in Ghor or elsewhere	No	This can offer an opportunity for an external verification of progress in the villages to see how the projects are progressing and also an opportunity for the WASH teams to share experiences and ideas between organisations	
Peer monitoring by experienced Afghan woman professional with gender and WASH knowledge probably from Kabul	No	To be able to hear the views of women and assess how well they are being engaged in and being able to engage in and influence the WASH projects in reality.	Because of the stark gender disparities in Afghanistan and high level of restrictions on women for movement and communicating with men outside of the family, it is essential that women are given the opportunity to speak with only other women present. This is good practice in most contexts, in addition to mixed sessions, as women often speak more freely in the absence of men, but much more important in the context of Afghanistan with the stark differentials in power and decision making opportunity between men and women.
External evaluation	Yes	To have external verification of the progress and impact, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of the programme and how the cross-cutting issues have been responded to.	An external evaluation should include opportunity to speak to both women and men in the projects as well as sector stakeholders. If evaluators are selected from outside of Afghanistan, they could be paired with a female evaluator from Afghanistan (or a female and male evaluator) and could work together to develop a checklist of questions and observations for the local evaluator to travel to the villages to make on the ground observations and meet with women and men in the villages. The additional evaluators for this should be budgeted in the original budget for the evaluation.

### **Good practice re-remote monitoring<sup>42</sup>:**

- i. The difficulties and costs of collecting information should be weighed against the perceived reliability and usefulness
- ii. The constraints should be identified in the log-frame and in dialogue with donors during the design phase
- iii. Keep to simple indicators that can be understood by all who will collect the data
- iv. Clear instructions are needed for those monitoring with definitions given for ambiguous words (such as 'clean' or 'safe')
- v. If qualitative data is needed then it may be better to use specific qualitative tools with a points system and clear instructions of how to use it rather than sweeping generalised statements (for example a transect walk with a list of potential observations that can be made)
- vi. Tools to be developed with those undertaking the monitoring, training given and trials in a location where mentoring is possible
- vii. It can be better to collect the data at specific times, such as just after the rains or during the hunger period, rather than making it a regular exercise so people don't get bored with the process
- viii. It is not fair for someone with no technical skills to verify technical quality, and hence another NGO or local government staff could be used (where they have access) to verify completion or quality
- ix. Mobile phones with a camera mode or a camera can be used to record progress, if the security situation permits
- x. Look for new and innovative methods for data collection to stop project staff getting bored or complacent with the data collection
- xi. Use external monitors, such as from other NGOs (local or INGO), teachers, private companies etc but be aware that no group is ever impartial, so it is still useful to use several sources wherever possible
- xii. Make sure that all monitoring is transparent and does not cause tension with the communities
- xiii. The staff receiving the information need good facilitation skills and ability and willingness to ask probing questions and not to just accept whatever is being reported
- xiv. Documentation should be made of meetings where feedback is discussed and action points identified to follow up with negative feedback to try and find solutions
- xv. Ensure that it is clear what the compensation situation would be for anyone undertaking monitoring tasks on behalf of ACF if they die or are injured during the process and this should be well documented and included in the contract or MoU or letter of agreement
- xvi. Be realistic at all stages and make sure that this realism is reflected in proposals and reports as monitoring is difficult in all projects let alone when there is no access ('Good enough' should be the goal)

---

<sup>42</sup> Taken directly from the following guidance with only limited modification: 'Guidelines for Monitoring and Evaluation in Limited Access Humanitarian Programmes' by Vivien Margaret Walden (2009)

## Annex VI. Kits Provided Through the Project

The kits in the following table were provided for different elements of the project.

For each kit there was a donation certificate which states that the items cannot be sold or used for any other purpose and has to be signed by the community member to whom it is being issued and also by ACF and copies prepared in duplicate.

Some care needs to be taken with the units for the donation sheets as sometimes kg is indicated when the item is noted in 'piece' or 'number' such as for posters or for O-ring. Plus for the spare parts supplied to the shop keeper it notes that the items must not be sold. This is important for the audit trail of what has been spent from the donors' funds and their distribution. It should be noted however that the evaluator only saw the English version of the documents and this may have been correct in the Dari versions.

**Table 11 - Kits provided to community members under the ECHO funded project A122**

<b>Kit for Community Hygiene Promotion</b>	<b>Nr</b>	<b>Kit for child to child health clubs</b>	<b>Nr<sup>43</sup></b>
Flip charts (kit of 5 MRRD flipcharts)	1	Soap for hand-washing	400
Books (kit of 2 books)	1	Glass for the school	300
Posters (kit of 2 posters)	1	Local broom (for schoolyard cleaning)	40
Backpack or sturdy bag	1	Garbage bin	50
River story poster	1	Jerry can	20
		Toilet paper	500
		Water tank for hand-washing	40
<b>Kit for the students of a school for classroom sessions</b>	<b>Nr<sup>44</sup></b>	<b>Kit for the Water Committee</b>	<b>Nr</b>
Notebook with hygiene messages	2,800	File cover (binder)	1
Pen with hygiene messages	2,800	Notebook	1
Hygiene leaflet (faecal cycle)	2,800	Pens	4
Soap	2,800	Plastic carpet (2m x 3m)	1
		Teapot	1
		Cap for tea	3
		Jerry can	1
		Soap	2
		River story poster	1
<b>Kit for the 3 demonstration and one workshop latrine</b>	<b>Nr</b>	<b>Kit for the 1 workshop latrine beneficiary</b>	<b>Nr</b>
Soap	4	Shovel	1
Latrine leaflet	4	Pick axe	1
20 litres water tank	4	Rubber bucket	1
ECHO and ACF visibility	4	Plastic sheeting for the door	1
Ewer jug (not for drinking, for toilet)	4		

<sup>43</sup> The number probably varies depending on the size of the school

<sup>44</sup> The number probably varies depending on the size of the school

<b>Kit for the Mechanic</b>	<b>Nr</b>	<b>Kit for the shopkeeper of a specified bazaar</b>	<b>Nr</b>
Socket spanner	2	PVC pipe, 2", 3m length	7
Hack saw	1	Can of PVC glue small	10
Hack saw blade	4	Plastic bush bearing	10
PVC glue small can	4	Hanger pin	5
Plain socket for jointing of 2 PVC pipes	3	Fulcrum pin	5
Sand paper	2	Rod centralisers	50
Fishing tool	1	U-seal	15
		Valve bobbin	15
		O-ring	15
		Pump rods, Indus	7
		Foot valve assembly	3
		Plunger assembly	3
		Nut and bolt	13
<b>Kit for the caretaker for the water point</b>	<b>Nr</b>	<b>Hygiene kit (for families)</b>	<b>Nr</b>
Rod centraliser	5	Soap for hand-washing	1
Plastic bush bearing	5	Leaflet with hygiene messages	1
O-ring	3	Ewer jug	1
Valve bobbin	3	Jerry can 20 litre with tap	1
U-seal	3		
Socket spanner	1		
Fishing tool	1		
Details of the winter kit, the larger hygiene kit and the shelter kit can be found in <b>Section 4.5.5</b>			

## Annex VII. Information provided to staff team

The following information and links were provided to the team in Afghanistan:

### Information provided to the WASH Advisor:

- WEDC Out in the Cold – cold weather construction
- MHM – various
- Overview of HP approaches
- Social marketing papers
- PHAST methodology materials
- Earthquake engineering
- WEDC disability book
- Vulnerability – aide memoir

### Links provided for:

- UNICEF, Afghanistan – MHM materials and experiences
- OXFAM-GB, Afghanistan, Gender Advisor – sharing experience of gender and WASH / engaging Women in WASH programmes and also experiences of working in partnership
- An expert on Google Earth – mapping advice if required

## Annex VIII. References

### ACF International, ACF Afghanistan

AAH-ACF-ACH (no date) 'Integrating Gender Mainstreaming in AAH-ACF-ACH'

ACF-IN (no date) 'Evaluation Policy & Guideline; Enhancing organisational practice through an integrated evaluations, learning and accountability framework'

ACF-IN (2010-2015) 'ACF International Strategy, 2010-2015'

ACF-IN (2011) 'Water, Sanitation and Hygiene Policy'

ACF Afghanistan (2010) 'Country Operational Strategy, Afghanistan, 2010-2012'

### Remote monitoring

Walden, V (2009) 'Guidelines for Monitoring and Evaluation in Limited Access Humanitarian Programmes', OXFAM-GB

Walden, V (2007) 'Mid Term Evaluation of Food Security and Livelihoods Programme in Kitgum District, Uganda', Full Report, OXFAM-GB Programme Evaluation, December 2007

### Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, WASH sector, Technical

Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation & Development (2010) 'Afghanistan National Rural Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene (WASH) Policy, 2010'

SSDA (2011) 'CLTS Implementation Manual'

UNDP (2007) 'Afghanistan Human Development Report, 2007; Bridging modernity and tradition: Rule of law and the search for justice'

Wikipedia (downloaded Aug 2011) 'Qanat', <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Qanat>

MRRD Technical designs for – dry vault and pit latrines; tubewell with handpump; dug well with handpump; gravity flow pipe schemes

### Gender, Women in Afghanistan

The World Bank (2005) 'Afghanistan; National Reconstruction and Poverty Reduction – The role of women in Afghanistan's future'

Afghanistan Analyst (downloaded Aug 2011) 'Non-governmental and international humanitarian organisations operating in Afghanistan', <http://afghanistan-analyst.org/ngo.aspx>

Frogh, W (downloaded Aug 2011) 'The Myths of Women's Empowerment in the Development of Afghanistan', <http://old.boloji.com/analysis2/0293.htm>

Qazi, A (downloaded Aug 2011) 'The Plight of Afghan Women', <http://www.afghan-web.com/woman/>

Shorish-Shamley, Z (downloaded Aug 2011) 'Women's Position, Role, and Rights in Islam', <http://www.afghan-web.com/articles/womenrights.html>

Qazi, A (downloaded Aug 2011) 'The Plight of Afghan Woman; Afghan Women's History', <http://www.afghan-web.com/afghanwomenhistory.html>

Jackson, A (2011) 'High Stakes; Girls' education in Afghanistan', Joint NGO Briefing Paper

### Menstrual health and hygiene in Afghanistan

Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan (2010) 'Assessment of knowledge, attitude and practice of menstrual health and hygiene in girls schools in Afghanistan'

Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan and UNICEF (2010, draft) 'Guideline on promotion of menstruation health and hygiene for trainers and supervisors'

Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan and UNICEF (2010, draft) 'Menstrual health and hygiene for adolescent girls in middle and high schools'

### Ghor Province

Program for Culture and Conflict Studies (2008) Information on Ghor Province, [www.nps.edu/programs/ccs](http://www.nps.edu/programs/ccs)

Wikipedia (downloaded Aug 2011) 'Ghor Province', [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gh%C5%8Dr\\_Province](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gh%C5%8Dr_Province)

### ACF Ghor, Programme documents and records

- ECHO Single Form for Humanitarian Aid Actions – 'Humanitarian Support to Vulnerable Households in the Most Water and Sanitation Scarce and Cold Regions of Afghanistan' – original proposal, rev 2 - 12/5/2010
- ECHO Single Form for Humanitarian Aid Actions – 'Humanitarian Support to Vulnerable Households in the Most Water and Sanitation Scarce and Cold Regions of Afghanistan' – Intermediate Report - 31/03/2011
- Assessment databases
- Selected project databases – well construction, well rehabilitation, karezes, biosand filter owners
- Water Committee lists – for the well and karezes projects (not the biosand)
- Winter kit selection database and list of beneficiaries
- Photographs of project activities and some winter kit beneficiaries
- Planning spreadsheets
- Weekly activity sheets with daily entries signed by staff members and supervisors
- Water Project MoU in English and Dari
- Winter kit assessment forms in Dari (translated)
- Biosand use assessment forms in Dari (translated)

### ACF Ghor, Hygiene Promotion Materials

School note book and pen

Ministry of Public Health and Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation & Development, Trainer / Supervisors handbook for hygiene promotion

Ministry of Public Health and Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation & Development, Community hygiene promoters handbook for hygiene promotion

ACF & WFP – part of the F diagram in A4 card (flies, fluids, fingers (not fields))

Cards (picture + text in the back) - used in the communities and schools (not clear which are provided to the CHPs as only 5 are noted to be provided):

#### Food hygiene:

- Washing and dishes with soap and storage
- Washing dishes with soap and covered containers
- Cooking food
- Using chlorine to disinfect water to wash fruits and salads
- Washing vegetables in water with chlorine

- *Washing dishes with soap and water & bad practice of putting water containers into the water storage container*
- *Covering food from flies*
- *Cooking food*

*Water sources, collection and storage:*

- *Storage of water in covered container / use of tap*
- *Use of protected water sources*
- *Bad practices – open water sources, animals drinking from the water sources, open well with the bucket on the ground*
- *Covering a well plus having a drainage channel plus latrine is far from the well (but in the drawing the well is too near)*
- *Covered water containers*
- *Protected water sources – well, hand-pump, karezees*
- *Bad practices for water sources, not protected, including well, karazees*
- *Cleaning the well surround*
- *Not playing on the water pump, male community member instructing children*
- *Covered water container*

*Water treatment:*

- *Chlorination and boiling of water*
- *Chlorinating water*

*Personal hygiene and hand-washing:*

- *Washing hands with soap*
- *Woman washing child's hands after using the toilet (water and soap available)*
- *Woman washing babies bottom and washing hands with soap afterwards*
- *Personal hygiene – nails, teeth, washing body and clean clothes*
- *Mother helping her child to put on shoes, after the picture of child walking outside without shoes and bringing mud back into the house*
- *Girls hair messy and mother brushing her child's hair*

*Treatment of diarrhoea:*

- *Mix of sugar / soap solution x 2*
- *Mixing of ORS*
- *Child with diarrhoea and mother giving the child ORS*

*Latrine use and maintenance:*

- *Man disposing of faeces from the latrine wearing protective clothing (gloves and scarf) and burying away from the water source and the houses (but in the drawing the well is too near)*
- *House at the end of the compound with a door on the excreta removal hatch*
- *Cleaning the latrine (women)*
- *Having a latrine inside your compound and a door from which the faeces can be collected outside the compound*
- *Picture of good and bad practice of a child defecating inside a latrine and also out in the open*
- *Picture of bad hygiene practices with faeces on the ground and on the latrine slab*
- *Dirty latrine and also a latrine with a woman cleaning it*
- *Latrine to have a door on the faeces compartment x 2 pictures*

*Solid waste disposal and environmental cleanliness:*

- *Burying of solid waste in a pit*
- *Burning rubbish and burying faeces away from the village*
- *Keeping the environment clean around the house compound*

*Operation and maintenance of water point:*

- *Repairing the well and handpump platform (men)*

*Posters:*

- *Part of the F diagram*
- *Process for keeping and cleaning the latrine, washing hands, disposing of child's faeces in the latrine, not using the faeces straight from the latrine on the garden*
- *Control of diarrhoeal diseases – use of ORS, taking to a health facility, IV drip, making ORS, making food and drink for the child etc*
- *Bridge across the river poster – with title – 'me for you and you for others' (we think this is about helping each other and working*